Literature Scan on the Status of Urban Indigenous Peoples in Brandon

Asset Briefing Papers

Intergovernmental Strategic Indigenous Alliance (ISIA)

June 1, 2017

Prepared by
Acknowledgements

Eko Nomos would like to thank all of the associates and researchers who contributed to the researching and production of these briefing papers:

Mary Ferguson, Senior Associate
Emmett Ferguson, Lead Researcher
Janet Murray, Senior Associate
Amanda Murray, Researcher, Editor and Fact checker
Samantha Blostein, Researcher
Kaitlyn Kochany, Researcher
Claire Letemendia, Editing
Andrew Burton, Open Data Administrator, City of Winnipeg
# Table of Contents

Introduction ................................................................. 1

Brief 1: Indigenous Housing.................................................. 5

Brief 2: Manitoba Indigenous Food Security ............................. 8

Brief 3: Urban Indigenous Justice ........................................... 12

Brief 4: Indigenous Families ................................................. 18

Brief 5: Indigenous Social Capital and Governance .................. 21

Brief 6: Urban Indigenous Skills and Employability .................... 27

Brief 7: Urban Indigenous Education ....................................... 31

Brief 8: Urban Indigenous Identity and Culture ......................... 37

Brief 9: Urban Indigenous Money ........................................... 43

Brief 10: Indigenous Health .................................................. 51

Brief 11: Vulnerability Context .............................................. 57

Conclusion.............................................................................. 67
Introduction

This series of briefing papers is the result of an extensive literature scan that was undertaken by Eko Nomos, a private sector research and evaluation firm, between January and April, 2017. The scan was a part of the Winnipeg Sustainable Livelihoods Project, an intensive research initiative designed to create a picture of community-based programs and services in Brandon and their ‘fit’ with the needs and interests of Indigenous Brandonites.

The purpose of the scan was to identify statistics and other evidence to determine the status of Indigenous Brandonites along the Sustainable Livelihoods’ continuum, a framework that explores different stages of movement out of poverty. Eko Nomos’ team of seven researchers cast its net wide, resulting in an extensive bibliography of over 280 resources from a range of sources including: Indigenous, academic, community, statistical and government literature. Much of the literature, and the statistics in particular, revealed a bleak picture of the current condition of urban Indigenous peoples in Manitoba. While there are some hopeful facts (e.g. the increasing trend of Indigenous women pursuing advanced education), the statistical data was overwhelmingly negative, showing very clear differences in the situation of urban Indigenous and non-Indigenous Manitobans.

For the researchers, a focus on statistics and facts was not enough to offer a more positive, asset-based perspective in our deliverables. In our conversations with community leaders, and in some areas of the literature we identified a sense of hope: Indigenous leaders told us that this is a time of exciting change, growth and optimism. Indigenous cultures are increasingly recognized in the life of the City and its economy. Strong Indigenous leadership and new economic trends such as Indigenous entrepreneurship are creating a sense of excitement and promise. The Truth and Reconciliation Commission’s conclusions and calls to action seem to be making a positive difference, leveraging a new kind of discussion about the future. We found that parts of the literature are offering solutions and new ‘Indigenized’ or ‘de-colonized’ ways of approaching problems and issues. These solutions are grounded in the diverse cultural traditions of Indigenous peoples. There is evidence of growing “protective factors” (Brascoupe & Mullholland, forthcoming) for building Indigenous-led development, such as: Cultural revitalization, Institutional assets (e.g. reorganization of provincial services to support self-governance – children’s services); leadership; and political assets.

To capture this more optimistic picture, we decided to share a summary of the key quotes, ideas and findings of our scan with our partners and colleagues in this project. We hope this resource will offer a more constructive starting point for understanding the complex history, context, current status and interests of Manitoba’s urban Indigenous peoples. We used the holistic, asset-based Sustainable Livelihoods framework as a foundation for the analysis, and for structuring this set of eleven briefing papers. We have taken a curatorial approach to the preparation of these papers, sharing key resources, presenting ways of framing each asset, analysing challenges, and profiling constructive perspectives and innovations that address those challenges.
Basic Needs:
Paper 1: Housing
Paper 2: Food Security
Paper 3: Justice

Connections:
Paper 4: Family
Paper 5: Social Capital

Skills and Employability
Paper 5: Education
Paper 6: Skills and Employability

Identity
Paper 7: Culture and Identity

Money
Paper 8: Financial Wellness

Health
Paper 9: Primary Health

Vulnerability context
Paper 10: Context

Conclusion
Closing remarks by the lead researcher

Most of these papers simply present quotations from published sources in order to keep the messages and findings of these Indigenous, scholarly, governmental, and/or organizational authors as the main focus of this analysis. While the quotations are separated under headings, no editorial commentary, no detailed synthesis, comparison or criticism of them has been carried out by the reviewers. Our aim is not to impose our analysis on the reader, but to compile and organize, and indicate potential threads for further inquiry.

The Sustainable Livelihoods framework is holistic and promotes a person- and community-centred analysis which is essentially intersectional. Specific issues identified in one asset area may thus be further developed in another. We hope to leave the reader with a better sense of the intersectional factors creating strength, or creating vulnerability for urban Indigenous Manitobans.

The Eko Nomos Research Team, June 1, 2017

---

1 The Sustainable Livelihoods framework and approach were developed by the UK Institute of Development Studies to promote community development in developing countries. Canadian researchers (Murray and Ferguson) later adapted the framework and approach to the context of front-line social services and poverty reduction in Canada.
Section 1:
Basic Needs
Brief 1: Indigenous Housing

Introduction
• Following a 1993 cessation of federal social housing programs, Winnipeg public, private and social providers of housing have been active and organized. (Walker, 2006, p. 391)
• The distinctive cultural or political concerns of Indigenous peoples have yet to be completely embedded in mainstream housing development or support activities. (Walker, 2006, p. 391; Deane & Smoke, 2010, p. 51)
• Homelessness may be thought of as a ‘place-based marginalization’ that exposes otherwise hidden hierarchies; homeless people use public spaces in marginal ways, challenging “norms and attitudes regarding the use of place.” (Taylor, 2014, p. 263)

Conceptualizing Indigenous Housing in Manitoba and Brandon
• Delivering low-cost housing programs at the neighborhood level can be difficult given the higher mobility of Indigenous people with low incomes. (Norris & Clatworthy, 2003, as cited by Walker, 2006, p. 401)
• “Social workers must recognize that oppressive relations exist in relationships to place and that the use of and meaning of place is not just a question for the discipline of geography.” (Taylor, 2014, p. 269)
• Homelessness and transience may be substantially created by the difficulty people having in finding a “sense of place” in a context where the social infrastructure and services are skewed “favouring Winnipeg at the expense of surrounding Indigenous rural communities.” (Alaazi et al., 2015)
• Cultural design themes and values for housing construction or operations may include:
  o Hospitality and Transitional Support
  o Circular planning, or planning that acknowledges cardinal directions and traditional practices or medicines
  o Honouring Elders
  o Community Economic Development through construction
  o Connection to the Land (Deane & Smoke, 2010, pp. 58-67)

Housing: Facts about Indigenous Peoples in Brandon
• 117 Homeless people were counted in Brandon on the night of Jan. 21, 2015; there is no data for how many of those people were Indigenous. (Brandon Neighborhood Renewal Corporation, 2015, p. 1)
• 21.3% of Brandon Indigenous households are spending more than 30% of their income on housing; compared to 18.8% of non-Indigenous Brandon households. (Ultra Insights Planning and Research Services, 2014, p. 53)
• 13.4% of Indigenous occupied dwellings in Brandon need major repairs; more than twice the rate for non-Indigenous (6.4%). (Ibid, p. 57)
• 11.5% of Indigenous households are overcrowded, compared to 3.7% of non-Indigenous households. (Ibid, p. 58)
• 46% of Indigenous households in Brandon own their dwelling (UIPRS, 2014, p. 53); but 10.2% of these households spend more than 30% of their income on housing. (UIPRS, 2014, p. 54)
• 11% of Indigenous Winnipeggers feel they ‘no choice at all’ in where they live. (Environics Institute, 2011, p. 54 – Note: the Urban Aboriginal Peoples Study (UAPS) was not delivered in Brandon; Winnipeg is the closest city in which this survey was delivered)

• About a quarter (27%) of Indigenous Winnipeggers feel they have ‘some choice’ in where they live. (Environics Institute, 2011, p. 54)

• 43% of Indigenous Winnipeggers feel they have ‘a lot of choice’ in where they live. (Environics Institute, 2011, p. 54)

What is the Vulnerability Context? What holds people back?

• Winnipeg Plan to End Youth Homelessness identifies factors creating vulnerability to homelessness as:
  o structural (e.g. colonialism; discrimination, poverty and housing affordability)
  o systemic (e.g. Child and Family Services; Justice, Health, Mental Health and Addictions, Education and EIA)
  o family and individual factors (e.g. abuse, neglect, domestic violence, parental substance use, rejection of gender and sexual orientation, teen pregnancy)

• Housing costs in Manitoba have increased above the average Provincial inflation rate every year for the past five (5) years, from a minimum of 0.3% (2012) above average inflation to a maximum of 1.1% above average (2014). (Statistics Canada Manitoba Consumer Price Index, 2016)

Success Factors & Key Directions

• “The funding and development of second stage housing models, based on local community-identified priorities, are needed to ensure that youth leaving the child welfare system do not become homeless.” (Brown et al., 2007, p. 63)

• Innovative Indigenous housing design and construction processes could:
  o Include meaningful consultation with future residents in the design of social housing projects
  o Provide delivery mechanisms that encourage joint applications for extended family groups
  o Employ strategic real estate purchases and reacquisitions with the goal of creating housing clusters
  o Explore design and policy that supports, rather than punishes, the transitional housing being provided by Aboriginal households
  o Explore ways to prevent tax dollars from funneling out of target communities into the hands of remote building development corporations (Deane & Smoke, 2010, p. 68)

Innovations and Promising Practices

• Winnipeg Plan to End Homelessness has been recently been created by “over 100 youth with experiences of homelessness; 200 community and government stakeholders; 70 different agencies, departments or associations”: It includes a number values and principles suitable for Indigenous-focused housing interventions.

• At Home/Chez Soi was a multi-year Housing First study conducted in Winnipeg and across Canada. It found that “the Indigenous therapeutic landscapes concept can provide a useful
framework for understanding Indigenous geographies of home and inhabitation.” (Alaazi et al., 2015, p. 35)
Brief 2: Manitoba Indigenous Food Security

Introduction

- Food security exists when “all people, at all times, have physical and economic access to sufficient, safe and nutritious food to meet their dietary needs and food preferences for an active and healthy life.” (United Nations Food and Agriculture Organization, 1996, p. 1, as cited in Government of Manitoba, 2013, p. 1)
- “Mark Winne has introduced the concept of a “food gap” between the rich and poor in the United States. The food gap is based on the prevalence of poverty plus lack of access to affordable and nutritious food for the poor.” (Novek & Nichols, 2010, p. 10)
- “According to Willows et al. (2011) 33% of Indigenous households are food insecure compared to 9% of non-Indigenous households.” (Cidro et al., 2015, p. 27)
- “Food insecurity is prevalent among many urban Indigenous populations in Canada, however little information is available in this area. In an urban context, food insecurity information on Indigenous people has depended on small samples obtained from food bank users.” (Tambay & Catlin, 1995, as cited in Cidro et al., 2015, p. 27)

Conceptualizing Indigenous Food Security in urban Manitoba

- “Cultural food security is an additional level of food security and suggests that additional research is required to understand Aboriginal perspectives on food security.” (Power, 2008, as cited in Cidro, Peters, & Sinclair, 2014, p. 3)
- Issues “pertinent to Indigenous food security” include: “(1) growing, harvesting, preparing and eating cultural food as ceremony, (2) cultural food as a part of connection to land through reciprocity and (3) re-learning [Indigenous Food Sovereignty] practices to address food insecurity.” (Cidro, Peters, & Sinclair, 2014, p. 4)
- “Indigenous food sovereignty comprises four central tenets: that the sacred responsibilities and relationships with the land supersede any colonial laws or policies; that the ability to define and respond to food-related needs should be self-determined; that these goals should be achieved through continued participation in the food systems at all scales of organization; and that these ends can ultimately only be achieved through policy and legislative reform.” (Morrison, 2011, p. 10, as cited in Rudolph & McLachlan, 2013)

Winnipeg Food Security: Facts about Indigenous Peoples

- 4% of Manitobans were food insecure in 2004. (Statistics Canada Canadian Community Health Survey, 2004, as cited in Epp, 2009)
- In 2004, 14.4% of Indigenous Canadian households were severely food insecure; almost a quarter of Indigenous households with children (23.1%) reported food insecurity among children, compared to less than 5% of non-Indigenous households with children. (Statistics Canada Canadian Community Health Survey, 2004, p. 17)
- 10.5% of Indigenous Manitobans responded that they have very low food security. (Statistics Canada Aboriginal Peoples Survey, 2012, table 577-0009)
- In 2014, more than 19% of Indigenous Canadian households were food insecure. (Tarasuk, Mitchell, & Dachner, 2014, p. 24)
- In 2012, the overall food insecurity rate in Winnipeg was 11.51%. (Tarasuk, Mitchell & Dachner, 2014, p. 28)
• 9.1% of Indigenous Manitobans responded that they have low food security. (Statistics Canada Aboriginal Peoples Survey, 2012, table 577-0009)
• More than half (53.1%) of lone-parent, female-led, off-reserve Aboriginal households and more than a quarter (27.1%) of two parent families were food insecure. (Statistics Canada Canadian Community Health Survey, 2004, p. 17)
• Accounting for income two-thirds, or more than 66% of families relying on social assistance or ‘other’ incomes experienced food insecurity (higher than 66%). (Statistics Canada Canadian Community Health Survey, 2004, p. 17)
• 76.6% of Indigenous Manitobans responded that they have high or marginal food security. (Statistics Canada Aboriginal Peoples Survey, 2012, table 577-0009)

What is the Vulnerability Context? What holds people back?
• Household food insecurity is linked to ongoing challenges with low income or poverty (Howard & Edge, 2013, p. 2, as cited in Government of Manitoba, 2013)
• Although 2016 saw inflation on foodstuffs slow to 0.3% since 2015, the five-year trend remains much higher than inflation generally: 2.2% average 2012-2016 compared to 1.5% annually for all other items. (Manitoba Consumer Price Index, 2016)
• There are over 3000 families currently on the waiting list for rent-geared-to-income accommodations, with many of the homes not large enough for families with multiple children. This lack of affordable housing could mean that many Aboriginal lone parents are spending the majority of their income on housing which causes financial shortages that result in food insecurity. (Baskin et al., 2009, p. 2)

Success Factors & Key Directions
• The Province of Manitoba (2013) committed to five (5) types of actions under its All Aboard strategy:
• Actions that improve access to nutritious food at no cost to recipients
• Actions that improve access to affordable and nutritious food
• Targeted actions that improve food security in northern communities
• Actions that address multiple risk factors and provide long-term solutions
• Actions that promote informed decision-making
• “Operationalizing Indigenous Food Security (IFS) must be done at a very tangible and practical level. In urban settings, IFS is often encumbered by a lack of access to traditional territories outside of the city, but it doesn’t have to be. Urban IFS must be approached with the viewpoint that food skills are at the heart of regaining control over food systems... there is an important opportunity to operationalize IFS principles as a means to not only address food insecurity, and chronic disease, but as a pathway for cultural reclamation.” (Cidro & Martens, 2015, pp. 13-14).

Food Secure Canada recommends:
• Coordinate a cross-sectoral approach to analyzing, forming, and influencing policies through the lens of Indigenous food sovereignty in the forestry, rangeland, fisheries, agriculture, mining, environment, health, and community development sectors.
• Create provincial and federal budgets that specifically finance food programs for both urban and rural remote northern communities. While these are short-term food security solutions, permanent solutions must lie within the domain of inherent sovereignty to out lands and
ways of life. Where applicable recognize the sovereignty promised at the time of Treaty signing. (Food Secure Canada, n.d.)

**Innovations and Promising Practices**

- North End Community Renewal Corporation, North End Food Security Network and the Indigenous and Métis Friendship Centre developed and offered “six traditional food workshops designed to build skills and awareness (upskilling) around traditional foods.” (Cidro & Martens, 2015, p. 6)
- “Neechi Foods and the West Broadway Development Corporation in Winnipeg are CED enterprises that have tried to implement both community economic development and food security goals.” (Novek & Nichols, 2014, p. 14)
Brief 3: Urban Indigenous Justice

Introduction

- “In Manitoba, 61% of the inmates were Aboriginal compared to 9% in the provincial population. In the other provinces/territories, the proportion of Aboriginal persons incarcerated ranged from twice to almost nine times their proportion of the provincial/territorial population.” (Government of Canada, 2013c)
- “Rates of incarceration in the provincial systems were highest among Aboriginals in Manitoba, with an estimated rate of 1,377.6 individuals in custody per 100,000 population.” (Owusu-Bempah et al., 2014)
- In 2015, “More than 70 per cent of inmates in Manitoba jails identify as aboriginal, despite only representing about 15 per cent of the province’s total population, according to census data. As the auditor general noted in last year’s report, this over-representation has been increasing — 25 years ago, aboriginal people accounted for only 46 per cent of Manitoba’s incarcerated adult offenders.” (Marcoux & Barghout, 2015)

Conceptualizing Indigenous Justice in Manitoba

- “The underlying philosophy in Aboriginal societies in dealing with crime was the resolution of disputes, the healing of wounds and the restoration of social harmony. It might mean an expression of regret for the injury done by the offender or by members of the offender’s clan. It might mean the presentation of gifts or payment of some kind. It might even mean the forfeiture of the offender’s life. But the matter was considered finished once the offence was recognized and dealt with by both the offender and the offended. Atonement and the restoration of harmony were the goals—not punishment.” (The Aboriginal Justice Implementation Commission, 2001, p. 26)
- “Although tribal cultures and institutions have been seriously affected by colonial practices, scholars note that this does not mean traditional worldviews and values have vanished. Ever resilient, tribal people have learned to adopt a veneer of conformity with Euro-American practices, keeping traditions alive below the surface and out of view (Peers, 1994). In his work with tribal communities that had experienced less interaction with dominant cultures, Assistant Crown Attorney Rupert Ross (1992) found profound cultural contrasts in dispute resolution between Ojibway and Cree people and Euro-Canadians.” Where, for instance, Ojibway/Cree dispute resolution took “harmony”, “healing” and “reintegration” as its goals, using methods of “elders... offering support, healing ceremonies, counseling, and by suggesting compensation and restitution to the victim”, Euro-Canadian goals were to “end problem behavior and discourage repetition” through punishment and isolation.” (Ross, 1992, as cited in Hand, Hankes, & House, 2012, p. 450)
- “The link between traditional law, self-determination and sovereignty is clear. The creation of laws by us based on our philosophies and approaches is fundamental self-determination. Self-determination demands that we articulate our own law. For me, self-determination means Indigenous peoples have to do everything for themselves, according to what is right for them. It means Indigenous peoples have to be in control of the development of their law. To give our written law over entirely to western influence is a mistake. Our traditional law sets forth who we are as “the People.” Those who say that it is an act of self-determination to adopt any law we please are wrong, if that law undermines who we are as “the People.” The issue of how we incorporate traditional law into existing structures altered by
Colonialism is an issue worldwide. Nation-states in Africa and in the western hemisphere, such as Papua New Guinea, are grappling with this very issue. It is important for tribal peoples to communicate on this and other issues concerning traditional law or internal law. It is through the sharing of experiences and ideas concerning traditional law, its use, and its strengths that many will benefit.” (Cruz, 2000, p. vi)

Indigenous Justice: Facts about Manitoba

- “(There is) a steady increase in the number of people who have been refused by Legal Aid Manitoba (especially for women who are victims of domestic violence and have no other alternative other than legal aid).” (Bennett, 2008, p. 42).
- Slightly fewer than one in ten Indigenous Manitobans is currently incarcerated (Statistics Canada, 2016, Table 251-0022); fewer than seven in one thousand non-Indigenous Manitobans are incarcerated. (Statistics Canada, 2016, Table 251-0022)
- Roughly 2.5% of Indigenous Manitobans are on probation or under a conditional sentence. (Statistics Canada, 2016, Table 251-026)

What is the Vulnerability Context? What holds people back?

- “Aboriginal over-representation is the end point of a series of decisions made by those with decision-making power in the justice system. An examination of each of these decisions suggests that the way that decisions are made within the justice system discriminates against Aboriginal people at virtually every point.... A number of the disproportionate and adverse impacts that characterize the dealings of Aboriginal people in the justice system:
  - More than half of the inmates of Manitoba’s jails are Aboriginal.
  - Aboriginal accused are more likely to be denied bail.
  - Aboriginal people spend more time in pre-trial detention than do non-Aboriginal people.
  - Aboriginal accused are more likely to be charged with multiple offences than are non-Aboriginal accused.
  - Lawyers spend less time with their Aboriginal clients than with non-Aboriginal clients.
  - Aboriginal offenders are more than twice as likely as non-Aboriginal people to be incarcerated.
  - The over-representation of Aboriginal people occurs at virtually every step of the judicial process, from the charging of individuals to their sentencing.” (The Aboriginal Justice Implementation Commission, 2001, pp. 81-82)
- “Why, in a society where justice is supposed to be blind, are the inmates of our prisons selected so overwhelmingly from a single ethnic group? Two answers suggest themselves immediately: either Aboriginal people commit a disproportionate number of crimes, or they are the victims of a discriminatory justice system. We believe that both answers are correct, but not in the simplistic sense that some people might interpret them. We do not believe, for instance, that there is anything about Aboriginal people or their culture that predisposes them to criminal behaviour. Instead, we believe that the causes of Aboriginal criminal behaviour are rooted in a long history of discrimination and social inequality that has impoverished Aboriginal people and consigned them to the margins of Manitoban society... Cultural oppression, social inequality, the loss of self-government and systemic discrimination, which are the legacy of the Canadian government’s treatment of Aboriginal
people, are intertwined and interdependent factors, and in very few cases is it possible to draw a simple and direct correlation between any one of them and the events which lead an individual Aboriginal person to commit a crime or to become incarcerated. We believe that the overall weight of the evidence makes it clear that these factors are crucial in explaining the reasons why Aboriginal people are over-represented in Manitoba’s jails.” (The Aboriginal Justice Implementation Commission, 2001, p. 81)

Success Factors & Key Directions in Indigenous Justice

- “Despite the magnitude of the problems, there is much the justice system can do to assist in reducing the degree to which Aboriginal people come into conflict with the law. It can reduce the ways in which it discriminates against Aboriginal people and the ways in which it adds to Aboriginal alienation. More importantly, it can give to Aboriginal people the opportunity to direct their own lives and communities through significant involvement within the existing system and by assisting them in the development of their own justice systems.” (The Aboriginal Justice Implementation Commission, 2001, p. 105)
- “Restorative justice, at its heart, seeks to engage three parties: the offender, the victim, and the community. This means that the formal judicial system is not a key party in this process; indeed, advocates of restorative justice often utilize language that restorative justice emphasizes a focus on the underlying causes of criminal behavior, and aims to reintegrate the offender into the community and “make things right” with the victim.” (Courtemanche 2015, p. 2)
- It is said that restorative justice possesses a “fundamental optimism” that offenders are capable of changing their behavior. Research has suggested that such processes create lower recidivism rates and higher satisfaction among victims and offenders than the traditional justice systems, in addition to being quicker and less expensive.” (Rosher, 2014; Chiste, 2013; Archibald & Llewellyn, 2006; Milward & Parkes, 2011, as cited in Courtemanche, 2014, p. 2)

Innovations and Promising Practices in Indigenous Justice

- “In Manitoba, there are currently several existing restorative justice programs, often operated by non-profit organizations. At the time that Bill 60 was first proposed, the government identifies several existing programs, such as Mediation Services, Restorative Resolutions, community justice committees, and the Onashewin Justice Circle, “a community-based, non-profit organization dedicated to establishing restorative and holistic approaches to achieving justice.” Mediation services [sic], for example, receives nearly 500 referrals per year and conducts a mediation session between victim and offender with the aim of developing an agreement between them in order to “put things right.” Restorative Resolutions, a program run by the John Howard Society of Manitoba, also provides this type of mediation and builds sentencing plans for adult offenders. There are over sixty justice committees in communities throughout Manitoba.” (Government of Manitoba, 2014; Mediation Services, n.d.; The John Howard Society of Manitoba, 2013; Manitoba, 2015, as cited in Courtemanche, 2014, pp. 5-6).
- “Manitoba Minister of Justice Andrew Swan first introduced Bill 60, The Restorative Justice Act, on April 23, 2014. In a Government of Manitoba press release, the Bill was described as intended to “enhance restorative justice and community-based solutions as part of a
balanced approach to increasing public safety and reducing crime.” (Government of Manitoba, 2014, as cited in Courtemanche, 2014, p. 6)
Section 2: Connections
Brief 4: Indigenous Families

Introduction

- “It was primarily through direct attacks on Aboriginal women’s powers and their role within the family and community systems that the disempowerment of First Nations people was achieved (Armstrong 1996; and Anderson 2000b).” (Bennett et al., 2008, p. 16)
- “Aboriginal women, especially single mothers, have the highest incidence of poverty in Canada - more than twice the rate of non-Aboriginal women. ... [and] may have experienced violence that led them to abandon their home, or they may have experienced the end of a marriage or common law relationship that has resulted in their being required to leave home and/or community (NWAC, 2007a; NWAC 2007b).” (Bennet et al., 2008, p. 18)

Conceptualizing Indigenous Families in Manitoba and Brandon

- “Another issue that exacerbates housing issues for First Nations women is in situations where they have no right in law to certain assets when their marriage breaks down, unlike all other women in Canada (Mann 2005).” (Bennet et al., 2008, p. 19)
- “By maintaining single mothers in a constant state of poverty Shelagh Day and others assert that it is a violation of women’s human rights under the Canadian Human Rights Act and in addition, is a sign of the state’s profound discomfort with, and unwillingness to support, the autonomy of women, and has questioned whether the Canadian human rights system is based on a definition of “human rights” which is too restrictive, in that it excludes social and economic rights that are a fundamental component of international human rights guarantees. Similarly, recent periodic reviews by United Nations human rights-monitoring bodies have led to unprecedented criticism of Canada for neglecting issues of poverty and social and economic rights, particularly among women (Jackman & Porter, 1999).” (Bennet et al., 2008, p. 21)

Indigenous Families: Facts about Winnipeg

- Indigenous children represent just over a quarter of the children in Manitoba (27.6%), (Statistics Canada National Health Survey, 2011, Table 5) but more than four fifths of the foster children in Manitoba, and fully one quarter of all Indigenous foster children in Canada (84.6%). (Statistics Canada National Health Survey, 2011, Table 5)
- 18.0% of Indigenous people in Brandon are ‘not in census families’, including 2% who are foster children. (UIPRS, 2014, p. 23, p. 48)
- In Brandon, 11.3% of Indigenous people ‘not in census families’ are foster children, amounting to 110 individuals. (Ultra Insights Planning and Research Services, 2014, p. 48)
- In Brandon, three in five (59.4%) of children live in single parent families; only one in three (33.9%) lives with both parents. (Ultra Insights Planning and Research Services, 2014, p. 45)
- In Brandon, the dependency ratio for Indigenous people is 61.9; for non-Indigenous people the ratio is 45.6 (note that seniors are more likely to be ‘self-sufficient’ than children as well, and given age demographics this difference is aggravated by the preponderance of young dependent children among the ‘dependent population’ of Indigenous people). (Ultra Insights Planning and Research Services, 2014, p. 43)
- 33.9% of Indigenous children live with both parents. (Ibid, p. 45)
What is the Vulnerability Context? What holds people back?

- Analyzing information from over 500 10- to 12-year-old Indigenous youth and their biological mothers, “Results of path analysis revealed significant direct and indirect effects whereby grandparent-generation participation in government relocation program negatively affects not only grandparent-generation wellbeing but also ripples out to affect subsequent generations.” (Walls & Whitbeck, 2012, p. 1272)
- “Courts struggling to find better ways of managing growing child protection caseloads (McNeilly, 1997; Lowry, 1998) and to reduce the number of children currently in foster care placements. (Lowry, 1998)” (Bennett et al., 2008, p. 29)
- Waldfogel (2000, pp. 314-315) identifies five basic flaws in current model of child protective services: over-inclusion of families that are low risk; under-inclusion of families at high risk who are not referred; inadequate resources; fragmented and disruptive processes; an inability to customize. (Waldfogel, 2000, as cited in Bennett et al., 2008, p. 42)

Success Factors & Key Directions

- “We insist on understanding unhealthy families and communities as socially and historically determined and demonstrate that the very same ideas and impulses that informed the residential schooling project, a project that is now understood to have caused widespread cultural trauma and to have exacerbated the ‘problems’ it aimed to remediate, continue to inform child welfare practices in Canada. Without accounting for these continuities and for the larger context within which addictions and mental health issues arise, government efforts to ‘help’ Indigenous peoples today will not only fail, they will worsen the health and well-being of Indigenous children, families, and communities. One of the ways in which such an ‘accounting’ can be undertaken is by addressing, and adding to, discussions about the social determinants of health.” (de Leeuw, Greenwood, & Cameron, 2011, pp. 291-292)
- Waldfogel (2000, p. 316) identifies the need for a “differential response” including three basic elements: “(1) a customized response to families, (2) the development of community-based systems of child protection, and (3) the involvement of informal and natural helpers.”
- “Family Group Conferencing is seen as a way of ensuring a more inclusive civil society (Pennell 2006).” (Bennett et al., 2008, p. 30)
- “Processes of this type frequently engage a mediator with ‘no decision making power, but promotes constructive communication between parties, using techniques such as separating people from the problem, focusing the parties on the best interests of the child, reframing, positive connotation, metaphoric storytelling, and establishing ground rules for dialogue (Giovannucci 1997; Barsky 1999).” (Bennet et al., 2008, pp. 30-31)

Innovations and Promising Practices

- Blackstock et al (2005, pp. 9-11) identified four phases of Reconciliation and five (5) Touchstones of Hope for Child Welfare; Reconciliation phases of truth telling, acknowledgement, restoration, and relating would be united by key values pertaining to self-determination, culture and language, holistic approaches, structural interventions and non-discrimination.
- Responsibility for Child and Family Services in Manitoba have been devolved to Indigenous Boards – There are First Nations, Métis and Inuit Authorities in Manitoba.
- The Brandon Urban People’s Advisory Council is building an Inclusive Community through family focused seasonal feasts. (Community Consultation, March 14, 2017)
Brief 5: Indigenous Social Capital and Governance

Introduction

• “Social capital characterizes a community based on the degree that its resources are socially invested, that it presents an ethos of trust, norms of reciprocity, collective action, and participation, and that it possesses inclusive, flexible and diverse networks. Social capital of a community is assessed through a combination of its bonding (within group relations), bridging (inter-community ties), and linking (relations with formal institutions) dimensions.” (Mignone, Elias, & Hall, p. 3)
• “Canadian Prairie Indigenous people give “surprisingly high life [satisfaction] evaluations given their lower average scores on objective measures” (Barrington-Leigh and Sloman 2016, p. 4). Subsequent analysis showed that the impact of material conditions on life quality ratings by Indigenous peoples in the Prairies is offset by “three factors predictive of higher Aboriginal SWL [satisfaction with life]. Aboriginal respondents reported a significantly higher frequency of visits with family and with friends, both of which are strong supports for SWL, and they reported having more children, which in our model was also predictive of high SWL.” (Barrington-Leigh & Sloman, 2016, p. 21)
• “Perhaps it is this that best describes what we see today in urban Aboriginal policy: the contradictions of colonialism. The government declares a “new relationship” but enacts policies and programs that instead reinforce old relationships. Government officials are quick to describe at length the consequences of the unbalanced power relationships of the past, but fail to see the parts they play in reinforcing the unbalanced power relationships now. Contemporary colonialism in Canada may be confused, but it is very much alive.” (Moore, Walker, & Skelton, 2011, p. 37)

Conceptualizing Indigenous Social Capital and Governance in Manitoba and Winnipeg

• “Memmot and Meltzer (2005) suggested that “Indigenous people actually invest significant time and energy into building social capital, but that it often manifests in ways that are not registered in terms of ‘economic development’ or that do not match the mainstream criteria of ‘good governance’”.” (Mignone, Elias, & Hall, p. 3)
• There are nevertheless significant social assets available for people, including ‘governance’ assets: “most provincial tribal councils have offices in the [Winnipeg] core. Levesque (2003) describes these institutions as creating an "Aboriginal public space" within the city and, along with developments such as the Corbiere decision, which allows off-reserve band members the right to vote in band elections, they can be seen as enduring links between urban and reserve communities” (Levesque, 2003, p. 23, as cited in Cooke & Belanger, 2006)
• “First Nations people in Canada and the world are increasingly rejecting Western, colonial frameworks of research and policy development. Instead we are reclaiming our right to be who we are, and we are revitalizing our cultures through promotion and utilization of indigenous research methodologies and development of culturally-rooted policy. Though the response of researchers and policy makers is not yet known, these developments will continue into the future due to the commitment and work of First Nations people.” (Ten Fingers, 2005, p. S60)

Brandon Social Capital: Facts about Indigenous Peoples
• Roughly half of First Nations Winnipeggers feel “Not at all close” or ‘Not too close’ to other members of their Indigenous community. (Environics Institute, 2011, p. 34 – Ed. Note: The Urban Aboriginal Peoples Study was not delivered in Manitoba; Winnipeg was the closest city in which it was delivered)

• 75% of Indigenous Winnipeggers believe non-Aboriginal people have a generally negative view of Indigenous people. (Environics Institute, 2011, p. 37)

• Four in ten Indigenous Winnipeggers think that non-Indigenous peoples’ impression of Indigenous people has improved in the last five years; two in ten believe it has become worse in the same period. (Environics Institute, 2011, p. 39)

• The vast majority either agree or strongly agree (93%) that people behave in a negative or unfair way toward Aboriginal people. (Environics Institute, 2011, p. 40)

What is the Vulnerability Context? What holds people back?

• The Urban Aboriginal Strategy itself has been occasionally criticized for the degree to which its initial rollout of the Supporting Community Partnerships Initiative focused on ‘managing the margins’ of urban society to create greater “social cohesion” without necessarily doing so “through means that assure Aboriginal self-determination and self-government as dimensions of programming.” (Walker, 2005, p. 410)

• “Currently, Treasury Board of Canada is requiring INAC to develop performance indicators for each of its programs in an effort to improve accountability and evaluate performance. This involves identifying an “ultimate outcome”, which INAC has identified as “improved well-being” of First nations people. First Nations, of course, want to define what this means for their own people and their own future. Unfortunately, a collaborative approach involving partnership with First nations is not how INAC is proceeding or intends to proceed.” (Ten Fingers, 2005, p. S61)

• “No level of government seems to want to assume responsibility for urban Aboriginal peoples, creating a jurisdictional vacuum in which each level of government tries to avoid responsibility.” (Hanselmann & Gibbins, 2003; Hanselmann, 2001; Graham & Peters, 2002, as cited in Moore, Walker, & Skelton 2011, p. 24)

• Elders “Stella, Sylvia, Dennis, and John also recognize that the suppression of language and culture resulted in much of the social disarray of Indigenous families and communities. Thus, Eurocentric education played an important role in the development of trauma. It has prevented the Indigenous foundation of holism from continuing in the Indigenous world.” (Hansen & Antsanen, 2016, p. 11)

Success Factors & Key Directions in Developing Social Capital and Governance

• “Political involvement and self-governance of urban Aboriginal people are decisive in creating a strong, healthy Aboriginal community. Hence, such involvement is critical to sustainability and should be monitored through the use of indicators. As Tauli-Corpuz (2005, p. 4) highlights, “doctrines and laws used by colonizers such as terra nullius and the Regalian Doctrine. . . disenfranchised indigenous peoples of their territories and resources.” Along with such disenfranchisement went many of the traditional rights and land held by Aboriginal and Indigenous people. Many Aboriginal and Indigenous people have little political voice or power and lack collective rights. This is especially so in an urban context where many Aboriginal people lack many of the rights afforded to Status and On-Reserve Aboriginal people. Indicators need to document the current level of rights and responsibilities of Aboriginal and Indigenous people through examining legislation, court
cases and various agreements or partnerships, or by the involvement of Aboriginal or Indigenous people in national, provincial, or municipal seats of government.” (Cardinal, 2006, p. 226)

- “I’ve argued in this chapter that a fundamental overhaul of traditional models of governance is required so that communities can acquire a greater degree of autonomy in decision making and the resources to get the job done. Governments, both at provincial and local levels, have traditionally viewed their roles as protectors of the public interest by providing leadership through regulatory control. Commitment to good governance must be supported by a resource-generation model that would permit local communities to function effectively. “Doing it by the book” and stovepipe structures of accountability need to be replaced by flexible standards and cross-sectoral approaches that would facilitate and empower communities in the creation of social capital.” (Boydell, 2005, p. 241)

Innovations and Promising Practices in Developing Social Capital and Governance

- “Finally, the data presented here refute the argument advanced in some quarters that the reinforcement of the bonds between Aboriginal people and building of bridges between Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal peoples are mutually exclusive goals. While not necessarily a surprising finding, it is nevertheless worth highlighting. Recall the definition of “institutional completedness” provided above: to the extent that both strong bonds among Aboriginal people and healthy relationships between Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal people may be viewed by urban Aboriginal people as “needs,” it is exciting to be able to report that [Aboriginal Friendship Centres] are making important contributions to both the well-being and the institutional completedness of Canada’s urban Aboriginal community.” (Jedwab, 2009, pp. 83-84)

- “A further challenge to the determination of Aboriginal health is knowledge gaps associated with the value of health indicators to aboriginal people (Mussell and Stevenson 1999a). For example, the current Health Canada approach to the design and application of health indicators includes formal employment as one of the criteria. It omits a critical aspect of Aboriginal employment, which consists of subsistence activity – time spent hunting, gathering, and fishing for food. While not considered significant in the predominant economic system, so-called subsistence activities are highly valued among Aboriginals.

The concept of social capital suggests a starting point for developing some of these new indicators. As this chapter attempts to argue, social capital is a critical part of building and maintaining a healthy community, and, equally, healthy individuals. It entails an approach that values kinship networks, community relationships, and, as highlighted by the history of Aboriginal people in Canada, reintegrates the human connection to our physical surroundings, to nature, to land. This connection is not yet commonly recognized.

Research is underway in Canada (National Roundtable for the Economy and Environment, International Institute for Sustainable Development, as well as provincial and regional initiatives) and elsewhere to develop social capital indicators, given increasing evidence for its relationship to a range of sustainable development issues.” (Dale & Onyx, 2005, pp. 137-138)
Section 3: Skills and Employability
Brief 6: Urban Indigenous Skills and Employability

Introduction

• “While Aboriginal peoples represent Canada’s fastest-growing population, their education and employment outcomes lag significantly behind the rest of the population.” (Bruce & Marlin, 2012, p. 1)
• “Aboriginal peoples in Canada have long advocated for interventions that focus on enhancing educational achievement and labour market participation as a strategy to reduce and eliminate Aboriginal disparities.” To date there have been countless attempts at all levels of “government, industry and postsecondary institutions to respond through various programming streams to enhance Aboriginal education, skills training and workforce development.” (Hall et al., 2015, p. i)

Conceptualizing Indigenous Employability in Manitoba and Brandon

• “I think it’s a natural characteristic of Native peoples to be able to do many things well ... I think the characteristic that has ensured our survival for the last 500 years has been the ability to have a diversity of talents and abilities to be able to move with the times, as opposed to being specialists.” (Redbird, as cited in Charleyboy, 2016, p. 6)
• “The assumption that Aboriginal peoples are inevitably going to transition to the wage economy reflects the rhetoric of a society that has already tried to separate Indigenous peoples from their land-based culture. Rather than assuming economic growth is virtuous, researchers should employ a more qualitative measurement of progress to determine how ... communities can benefit from development and increase their well-being.” (Weinberg, 2014, p. 8)
• “Aboriginal communities exhibit a predominantly collective approach to economic development that is closely tied to each group’s traditional lands, its identity as a nation, and its desire to be self-governing. This collective development approach is intended to serve three purposes: the attainment of economic self-sufficiency, the improvement of socio-economic circumstance, and the preservation and strengthening of traditional culture, values and languages.” (Anderson, 1999, pp. 13-14)

Indigenous Skills and Employment: Facts about Brandon

• In Brandon, the percentage of Indigenous people who do not have a high school diploma has increased since 2001. Indigenous people in Brandon aged 25 to 64, 27.6% had no certificate, diploma or degree (28.9% nationally) while the proportion for non-Indigenous people in the same age group was 12.2%. (Moscou, Rempel, Sinclair, and Ramsay, 2016, p. 18)
• The percentage of Brandon Indigenous people with a high school diploma or equivalent was 24.1% (28.1% for non-Indigenous people) in 2011. (Ultra Insights Planning and Research Services, 2014, p. 66)
• The percentage of Indigenous people with a post-secondary diploma or degree is 48.1% (59.7% for non-Indigenous people) in 2011. (Ibid.)
• In 2011, 66.6% of the Brandon Indigenous population was participating in the labour force, compared to 72.4% of non-Indigenous Brandonites; 12.1% of Indigenous people in Brandon reported being unemployed in 2011, compared to 5.1% of non-Indigenous people there. (Ultra Insights Planning and Research Services, 2014, p. 77; 80)
• The data on labour participation rates show that Aboriginal youth participation rates are more than fourteen percentage points lower than those for Non Aboriginal youth in Winnipeg. This is a substantial portion of the young adult population at a stage in their lives where transitions to education or employment can be crucially important in achieving sustainable livelihoods. (Ultra Insights Planning and Research Services, 2014, p. 85 – *no data for Brandon was available on this metric*)

• Attachment to the labour force and success in the labour force appears much lower for Indigenous females with limited education. A number of factors, including limited job opportunities and low wages may explain these findings. (Ultra Insights Planning and Research Services, 2014, p. 92)

What is the Vulnerability Context? What holds people back?
• “Barriers to skills training and workforce development for Aboriginal people in Canada:
  o Socio-economic issues (i.e. Childcare, addictions, housing, transportation, racism and justice)
  o Lack of essential skills and educational attainment (i.e. Reading, numeracy, document use, etc.)
  o Inadequate programs and content (i.e. funding, delivery, availability, structure, content, access)
  o Lack of collaboration among stakeholders (i.e. government, industry, educational institutions, and service providers)
  o Systemic issues (i.e., disincentives, lack of employment opportunities, union regulations, apprenticeship opportunities, financial barriers)” (Hall et al., 2015, p. iii)

• “The barriers and best practices are largely consistent across all jurisdictions and are widely known. Research suggests that the same challenges and best practices have existed since the 1990s. Change has been slow because of weak collaboration, systemic issues regarding policy and funding and failure to take holistic approach to addressing challenges and problem solving with regard to Aboriginal education.” (Hall et al., 2015)

• Young people were especially hard hit by the 2008/2009 economic downturn. “Participation rates fell between 2008 and 2010 among youths, but more so among Aboriginal than non-Aboriginal youths… Among Aboriginal youths, participation rate declines were steepest in Quebec, Manitoba and Alberta.” (Usalcas, 2011, p. 24)

Success Factors & Key Directions in Indigenous Education
• “Research has shown that barriers to education and labour market development begin to arise in early childhood and have cumulative effects throughout adolescence into adulthood. To successfully prepare adults for the workforce, changes are required in early childhood education to stimulate learning and the desire to learn by crafting culturally relevant programming and delivery method, and by providing quality education communities.” (Hall et al., 2015, p. 23)

• “In most cases, best practices have arisen as a direct result of addressing challenges and barriers. Problem solving also requires unique approaches to the myriad of situations occurring across different jurisdictions. Best practices largely run parallel to barrier and challenges:
  o Provide social supports to complement program delivery
  o Focus on essential skills training and bridging programs
o Deliver community-based and engaging programming
o Use approaches to deliver culturally appropriate material in a manner consistent with learner styles
o Engage in stronger collaboration and coordination among stakeholders with a focus on long-term partnerships
o Pursue systemic changes to policy and regulations that provide more flexibility, accountability and opportunities” (Hall et al., 2015, p. iii)

Innovations and Promising Practices in Developing Indigenous Skills and Employability

- Winnipeg-based Centre for Aboriginal Human Resource Development Inc. (CAHRD) pursues community partnerships to connect Indigenous participants to work: “Community Projects is a division of CAHRD that is committed to working in partnership with industry, the community, institutions and all levels of Government, to enable urban Aboriginal people to overcome employment barriers, pursue life-long learning, and engage in rewarding employment and career opportunities.” (Centre for Aboriginal Human Resource Development, n.d.)

- “Pathways to Education – Winnipeg, established in 2010, has a particular focus on meeting the needs of Aboriginal students who constitute over 75 per cent of those enrolled in the program. As a result, several modifications were made to the Pathways model at this site. Student-staff ratios are lower, and the programming reflects the more holistic approach of the Medicine Wheel, including hot dinners five days a week; mentorships that focus on health, wellness, and culture; outreach to extended families; and stronger cultural focus in activities including the involvement of Elders. The central elements of the Pathways programming — counselling and mentoring, academic tutoring, adult support worker, and financial assistance — remain unchanged. In its second year of operation, the program serves 240 Grade 9 and 10 students and a small cohort of senior students.” (Bruce & Marlin, 2012, p. 79)

- “An important catalyst behind the renewed spirit of Aboriginal entrepreneurship is the growing belief that economic success can be achieved without sacrificing core values, particularly when it comes to the protection of the land and the environment. For example, Aboriginal entrepreneurs are setting up environmentally-focused enterprises in industries like renewable and alternative energy development. ... There is also an increased focus on building the next generation of Aboriginal entrepreneurs. For example, the Aboriginal Youth Entrepreneurship Program is a program offered by the Martin Aboriginal Education Initiative.“ (TD Economics, 2015, p. 6)
Brief 7: Urban Indigenous Education

Introduction

- “A number of factors are unique to Aboriginal students. These involve macro-structural, social factors such as poverty, racism and marginalization as well as more specific, micro-structural factors such as school and classroom climate.” (Castagno & Brayboy, 2008; Lamb, 2014; Preston & Claypool, 2013; Preston, Taylor, DesRoches, & Taylor, 2014; Whitley, 2014; Whitley et al., 2014, as cited in Moscou et al., 2016, p. 3)
- “Research on the Aboriginal student educational achievement also identified individual, community factors such as the residual effects of residential schools, poor health and living conditions, high rates of suicide in the community, mental illness, and alcohol addiction.” (Battisti, Friesen, & Krauth 2014; Bombay, 2014; Friesen & Krauth, 2012; Raham, 2009, as cited in Moscou et al., 2016)
- “In contrast, several scholastic success factors positively contribute to educational attainment... They too are individual, family and community factors. They include variables such as school climate, cultural effective teaching, parental involvement, participation in extracurricular activities, student engagement, and positive self-image.” (Arriagada, 2015; Hare & Pidgeon, 2011; Kanu, 2007; Lamb, 2014; Maclver, 2012; Preston & Claypool, 2013; Whitley, 2014, as cited in Moscou et al., 2016, p. 3).

Conceptualizing Indigenous Education in Manitoba and Winnipeg

- “From an Indigenous perspective, the power of story is the art of placing learners at the critical centre of their own being and life-worlds. It is a practice that I see as being at the heart of Anishinaabe pedagogy. Within this way of learning, an animate learning space is necessary. For example, Elders and oral storytellers brought our existence as a people to life [...] From a Western lens, Anishinaabe pedagogy in practice is not subject-centred, as it is in Western curriculum where content and subject matter receive the primary emphasis (Battiste, 2002). Rather, it is learner-centred, subjective, and relies on relational management (Absolon, 2009). It has a humanistic focus and is aimed at exploring the interrelationships between all things within a critically reflective paradigm. Moreover, it takes into account feelings, attitudes, and values that can add affective components to the conventional subject matter curriculum with a focus on knowledge and skills acquisition.” (Chartrand, 2012, p. 152)
- “Since Indigenous knowledge was passed from one generation to the next through modeling, practice, and animation, not through the written word, but in the oral tradition, Aboriginal languages were a critical link to Indigenous knowledge and to the survival of the culture (Battiste 1998). Within traditional Aboriginal cultures all people are respected and viewed as having important contributions to make to a community however Elders are shown a special respect (Barnhardt 1990). Elders are the archives of the communities, the holders of traditional knowledge (Augustine 1998, Manitoba Education & Youth 2003), and children were taught that respect, wisdom, and knowledge were gained by listening to and observing Elders (Hughes & More 1997, Nelson-Barber 1999). In traditional Aboriginal societies, children were taught to view all of the people with whom they had contact as being related
to them. This sense of belonging and kinship was not limited only to people, but also extended to the land as well.” (Ledoux, 2006, p. 271)

Indigenous Education: Facts about Brandon

- “One in four children in Manitoba are not ready for Kindergarten, but 1 in 2 Aboriginal children are not ready.” (Flanagan & Beach, 2016, p. 9)
- “In Winnipeg RHA [Regional Health Authority] overall, the rate of retention from Kindergarten to Grade 8 for Métis children is statistically higher than for all other children (3.7% vs. 1.9%).” (Martens et al., 2010, p. 457)
- “Roughly 25,000 Aboriginal peoples reach the age of majority every year (age 18). However, just 8,000 of these individuals enroll in post-secondary education. One in five Canadians will obtain a post-secondary degree; just one in thirty-three will achieve the same among Aboriginal Canadians.” (Gulati, 2013, p. 21)
- “In Brandon, the percentage of Indigenous people who do not have a high school diploma has increased since 2001. Indigenous people in Brandon aged 25 to 64, 27.6% had no certificate, diploma or degree (28.9% nationally) while the proportion for non-Indigenous people in the same age group was 12.2%. (Moscou, Rempel, Sinclair, and Ramsay, 2016, p. 18)
- “In Winnipeg’s low-income North End, community-based programs offering literacy programming are limited to part-time operations, even though they have wait lists of people wanting to improve their literacy levels, and even though at least some of them have applied for (and been denied) funding to move to full-time operations.” (Silver, 2016, p. 7)
- Almost one-half (48.1%) of Indigenous people had a postsecondary qualification in 2011 (48.4% nationally). In comparison, almost 60% of the non-Indigenous Brandon population aged 25 to 64 had a postsecondary qualification in 2011. (Ultra Insights Planning and Research Services, 2011, p. 67).
- “In Brandon, 17.3% of Aboriginal adults 25 to 44 years of age were attending school compared with 10.6% of Non-Aboriginal adults in this age range. Among both the Aboriginal and Non Aboriginal population, fewer youth (15 to 19 and 20 to 24 years of age) were attending school when compared to Winnipeg.” (Ultra Insights Planning and Research Services, 2011, p. 75).

What is the Vulnerability Context? What holds people back?

- “Having attended a residential school or having a family member attend a residential school positively correlated with leaving school early.” (Lamb, 2014) “Parents may fear that the aim of the mainstream educational institutions is to assimilate their children.” (Moscou, Rempel, Sinclair, & Ramsay, 2016, p. 30)
- “The legacy of residential school has been associated with poor academic achievement, chronic unemployment or underemployment, poverty, insufficient school funding, inadequate teachers and unsuitable curricula (TRC, 2015). Whitley (2014) commented that parents’ residential school experience may result in reluctance to become involved in their children’s schools forging the opportunity to build collaborative relationships with the children’s teachers.” (Moscou et al., 2016, pp. 30-31).
- “Low educational achievement of parents has a significant impact on the education achievement of their children including high school graduation.” (Lamb, 2014; Raham, 2009; Spence, White, & Maxim, 2007, as cited in Moscou et al., 2016, p. 31)
• “Being from a single parent household negatively correlated with age appropriate graduation and positively correlated with leaving school early. On the other hand, Spence et al. (2007) found that families with two of more children positively correlated with graduation.” (Spence et al., 2007, as cited in Moscou et al., 2016)

• “High rates of residential mobility also contribute to lower education achievement levels (Hammond, Linton, Smink & Drew, 2007). Frequent moving disrupts learning, reduces achievement (Raham, 2009) and has a negative effect on establishing the positive peer relationships that support academic success (Burack et al., 2013).” (Moscou et al, 2016, p. 32)

• “The broad and entrenched assumption of most post-secondary curricula is that Eurocentric knowledge represents the neutral and necessary story for 'all' of us” (Battiste et al., 2002, p. 83). This "homogenizing, mono-cultural" approach is not appropriate for the complexity of the Aboriginal people (Ball, 2004, p. 457).” (Anonson, 2014, p. 6)

**Success Factors & Key Directions in Indigenous Education**

• “Stephen Harris (1990) argues that it is possible to have the ability to operate effectively in two sets of culturally appropriate ways, referring to it as “two-way Aboriginal schooling.” Hughes and More (1997) discuss a similar “both ways” concept, the hallmark of which is that, while it is necessary for some aspects of each domain to grow separately, there also needs to be a merging of some aspects of each domain.” (Ledoux, 2006, p. 279)

• “In schools with Aboriginal students, educators struggle with the challenges of providing education which is meaningful and relevant, and at the same time mindful of the outcomes mandated by the provincial government. Efforts at adding Aboriginal content to curricula usually consist of adding units designed to “enrich” existing curriculum content instead of changing the core assumptions, values, and logic of the curriculum itself. Meaningful and relevant education for Aboriginal students, however, requires fundamental changes to create a curriculum that is rooted in Aboriginal understanding of the world, not only in content, but also in the teaching and learning activities which are in harmony with the life experience of Aboriginal students (Augustine 1998, Munns, Lawson & Mootz 2000, Tharp & Yamauchi 1994). It is only when Aboriginal students find a sense of place and belonging in the school system that their achievement levels will improve (Antone 2000, Augustine 1998, Baskin 2002, Cardinal 1999, Battiste 2002, Greenway 2002, Kirkness 1999, Manitoba Education and Youth 2003, Pewewardy 2002).” (Ledoux, 2006, p. 267)

• “Osborne provides a framework of nine “signposts” which is compatible with Demmert and Towner’s (2003) findings on culturally based education as well as Pewewardy and Hammer’s (2003) and Reyhner, Lee and Gabbard’s (1993) suggestions on culturally responsive teaching.” (Ledoux, 2006, p. 276) Strategies identified through literature review include:
  o Story telling
  o Talking circles
  o Concept mapping/webbing
  o Video
  o Experiential learning
  o Cooperative learning
  o Scaffolding Instruction (wherein support and guidance is gradually withdrawn to build confidence and competence of individual)
Whole language approach (an integrated approach that emphasizes the experiences of students) (Barnhardt, 1990; Bell, 2004; British Columbia Ministry of Education, 1998; Castellano & Lahache, 2000; Catholic District School Board Writing Partnership, 2003; Charlie, 2002; Hughes & More, 1997; Manitoba Education and Youth, 2003; Nichol, 2005; Swisher & Deyhle, 1989; Tharp & Yamauchi, 1994, as cited in Ledoux, 2006, pp. 276-278)

Innovations and Promising Educational Practices

- "In 2009, Manitoba became the first province in Canada to produce an Adult Literacy Act, followed by an Adult Literacy Strategy and Program. The 2015 Provincial Budget increased funding to adult literacy and Adult Learning Centres by 2.5 percent, despite difficult fiscal restraints, and Manitoba appears to be the only province in the country that has budgeted increased funds for literacy and adult education (Hayes 2015b)." (Silver, 2016, p. 7)
- “Children of the Earth High School, in partnership with Heritage Canada, offers culturally appropriate programming for female students. The Ka mah mo beyot Ikwezanzsuk Program (Girls Sitting Together) is offered to grade 9 students. Plans are underway to offer culturally appropriate programming for males in grades 9 and 10 through the Oshki inniek Kabahbiindigaot Program (Young Men Entering).” (Winnipeg School Division, 2010, p. 10)
- “The Winnipeg Boldness Project is using tools from the fields of social innovation and collective impact to develop its six-year strategy. By using a model called a social lab, the project is bringing community ideas/feedback together with Early Childhood Development science in order to create and test ideas for systems change.

The Project is collaborating with a wide range of cross-sectoral stakeholders including community leaders, businesses, and community residents, to co-create solutions that we are calling Proofs of Possibilities (POPS.) POPs are action items that have been identified as priority for early childhood development and family wellbeing in the neighbourhood.” (Winnipeg Boldness Project, n.d.)
- "Elders in the classroom bridge two cultural domains (Medicine, 1987). They are valuable in restoring a culture that has been lost to many younger generations. In a society that is losing its language and culture with each generation, Elders in the educational environment can be a guiding light for the future and a connection to the past. This will help students to discover their traditional roots and aid in self-discovery. Traditions and rituals can also be taught to help in attaining a well-balanced life as a student, which students can share with their families and use for the rest of their lives." (Anonson, 2014, p. 6)
Section 4: Identity
Introduction

- “The Canadian census emphasizes the general terminology “First Nations” and “Métis.” In contrast, First Nations participants in this study identified with particular First Nations cultures, for example “Cree” or “Dene.” Métis identities were also heterogeneous, including individuals who anchored their Métis identities in prairie Métis Nations cultures and communities and those who identified as Métis because of their “mixed” ancestry. While many of these individuals had grown up on-reserve or in Métis communities, others had reclaimed their identities as grown-ups, despite adoption or the silence of their parents about their ancestry. This practice suggests that identification with particular First Nations and Métis groups will continue. The categories available for self-identification of Aboriginal people in the census may need to move to these more specific identities.” (Peters, Maaka & Laliberte, 2014, p. 299)

- “The distinct cultures of Aboriginal and Indigenous people are of critical importance to who they are, and are also important factors for sustainable development. Culture is a critical piece of sustainability that is often left out; including Indigenous people in the development, design, and implementation of such cultural indicators works to fill this void. In a survey of Indigenous people designed to identify Indigenous People’s cultural indicators (IITC, 2003), nearly all respondents stressed the importance of traditional foods and practices in maintaining culture. The ability to access traditional foods, participate in traditional activities, and speak traditional languages are vital to maintaining a vibrant and healthy culture. The conservation of culture, cultural education, and the protection of objects of cultural value are also important to the maintenance of culture. Hence, such indicators are important in evaluating the overall sustainability of a region in which Aboriginal people are a critical part. How-ever, it is critical that indicators that document cultural trends be developed in discussion with local Indigenous groups.” (Cardinal, 2006, p. 226)

Conceptualizing Indigenous Identity and Culture in Manitoba and Winnipeg

- “The court determined that urban Aboriginal political organizations can represent urban Aboriginal interests and that the HRSDC must provide funding for the infrastructure required to deliver services and establish representative governance. In doing so, the court defined off-reserve Aboriginal people as a group of self-organized, self-determining, and distinct communities, analogous to a reserve community. While reinforcing the political connection between on- and off-reserve Aboriginal people, the court importantly created an Aboriginal community separate from the reserve.” (Belanger, 2013, p. 69)

- “However, no matter how reasonable it may be to posit a distinctive urban identity, well-documented Canadian jurisdictional peccadilloes around federal government interpretations of section 91(24) of the British North America Act (see Graham and Peters 2002) have effectively precluded official recognition of urban Aboriginality as a distinctive identity. This remains the case despite the half million of us who have lived and continue to live in Canada’s cities, and the decades-long legacy of urban Aboriginal community-building in often inhospitable terrain.” (Andersen, 2013, p. 47)

- Andersen (2013) lists twelve dimensions he considers as constituting sufficient grounds for the analysis and of a distinctive ‘urban Aboriginal identity’: economic marginalization; a growing professional/middle class; experience of racism and social exclusion; cultural diversity; legal diversity; status blindness; urban Aboriginal institutions; distinctiveness of
urban Aboriginal policy ethos; the character of informal networks; attachment to non-urban communities; struggles of the political representation of urban Aboriginals; and the place(s) of women in urban Aboriginal social relations.

**Indigenous Identity and Culture (Values and Beliefs): Facts about Brandon and Urban Manitoba**

- 93.6% of Indigenous Brandon residents speak English; 6% speak English and French. (Ultra Insights Planning and Research Services, 2014, p. 49)
- Less than 5% of Indigenous people in Brandon have an Indigenous language as their mother tongue; (Ultra Insights Planning and Research Services, 2014, p. 49) more people report being able to conduct a conversation in an Indigenous language, indicating that the language is learned at a later time. (Ultra Insights Planning and Research Services, 2014, p. 50) The number who report being able to hold a conversation is 7.0%. (Ibid.)
- 1 or 2% of Indigenous Winnipeggers are ‘not at all proud’ to be First Nations, Métis or Inuk. About 3% of Indigenous Winnipeggers are ‘not very proud’ to be First Nations, Métis or Inuk. (Environics Institute, 2011, p. 25; Ed. Note: The Urban Aboriginal Peoples Study was not delivered in Brandon; Winnipeg is closest city in which it was delivered.)
- About one in five Winnipeg Indigenous people is ‘somewhat proud’ of being First Nations/Métis/Inuk; More than 70% of Indigenous people are very proud of being First Nations/Métis/Inuk. The same is true about being Canadian, though among Métis, pride in Canadian identity rises to 81%. (Environics Institute, 2011, pp. 23-24)
- 19% of Indigenous Winnipeggers know their family tree ‘not well at all’; 30% know their family tree ‘not very well’. 26% know their family tree ‘very well’. (Environics Institute, 2011, p. 25)
- 24% of Indigenous Winnipeggers perceive ‘no’ cultural activities in Winnipeg (29% of Métis, and 13% of First Nations respondents); 12% perceive ‘few’ cultural activities, and 31% perceive ‘a lot’ of cultural activities available in Winnipeg. (Environics Institute, 2011, pp. 29-30)
- 10% of Indigenous Winnipeggers ‘never’ participate in cultural activities; 21% ‘rarely’ participate, and 32% “frequently” participate. (Environics Institute, 2011, p. 30)

**What is the Vulnerability Context? What holds people back?**

- “As it is, the social science literature in general, and the literature concerned with Indigenous populations in particular, continues to get much of this picture badly wrong. That is, despite the fact that more than half of North America’s cultural richness is owed directly to the remarkable diversity of its remaining Indigenous peoples (Chandler, 2001), and despite the fact that this small nubbin of the total population hosts at least 20 mutually uninterpretable languages, a welter of unique cultural and spiritual practices, and has suffered a patchwork history of different colonial regimes, the woods continue to be full of badly mistaken claims concerning what is supposedly true about the whole of the loosely federated Aboriginal world. For ease of reporting, or of streamlining government practices, or owing to simple ignorance or sloth, far too many contributors to the literature on Indigenous well-being continue issuing claims that indiscriminately bracket together, and then batch-process all of Canada’s First Nations, Inuit, and Métis communities, communities that are united, as far as I can see, by little more than their “otherness” and a shared history of abuse.” (Chandler, 2014, p. 188)
• “Cultural continuity is the ability to preserve the historical traditions of a culture and carry them forward with that culture into the future, and it is closely linked to the concept of cultural identity (Brown 2003). Cultural identity has a major influence on our confidence and self-esteem. However, because of years of colonization and assimilation there is a disconnect from the cultural values and traditions espoused in Indigenous communities (Morris 2007). Cultural disconnection and lack of cultural continuity creates a loss of confidence at the individual level in understanding how to live life and make decisions (MacNeil 2008).” (Krieg, 2016, p. 29)

Success Factors & Key Directions
• “There was an assumption that by the fourth generation, the assimilation would be so complete that Aboriginal languages would make up an insignificant portion of the non-official languages spoken. However, the data reveals that, while there has been some loss of language over the years, the dire predictions have not come to fruition. One major reason for this not happening is that Aboriginal identity is critical to maintaining “personal relationships” networks (integrative function) for social and community purposes (Morita, 2007). In addition, Aboriginal languages are now offered as a “credit” subject in secondary and post-secondary schools across the country. Enrollment figures reveal these classes have bloomed over the past decade.” (Frideres, 2014, p. 307)
• “Knowledge transfer, as commonly understood, is a top-down process by means of which scientific knowledge generated within the academy is made to trickle down until it eventually reaches community-level workers. In addition to being suspect on other grounds, such “made in Washington or Ottawa” solutions are broadly seen as disrespectful by “served” communities, and openly confirmatory of the positional inferiority commonly accorded to indigenous cultures. The research that I have summarized suggests, as an alternative, that if indigenous knowledge is recognized as real knowledge, then, in the place of more traditional top-down approaches, what needs to be seriously explored is the possibility of a community-to-community lateral transfer of indigenous knowledge and best practices between groups that have enjoyed greater and lesser levels of success in meeting the needs of their own [people].” (Chandler, 2014, p. 195).

Innovations and Promising Practices
• “For some, connecting to Indigenous musical heritages including regional and pan-Aboriginal elements, allowed them to feel pride and self-esteem after experiencing social and cultural disassociation or dislocation, which correlate positively with addictions (Alexander 2008:58-59, 131-136) and are tragedies of cultural assimilation. For others, expressing personal meaningfulness about Aboriginal identity through music had the potential to repair damaged connections to self and senses of selfhood.” (Harrison, 2013, p. 17).
• “In framing political performance and socially engaged art in Indigenous terms, the reader must understand, as artist Agard said, “‘Art’ described in Indigenous terms... is not separated from tribal life. We make art and we are art” (Farris Dufrene 56). In conversations and observations, these artists felt that their artwork was a part of them and impacted their community, since there was no segregation between the roles of artist and community member.” (Nagam, 2006, p. 53)
Section 5:
Money
**Brief 9: Urban Indigenous Money**

**Introduction**
- “Financial wellness is understood by Aboriginal peoples as the continuous process of balancing income, saving, investing and spending to achieve one’s life goals (physical, emotional, mental and spiritual) over the life cycle, and to maintain a state of wellness for individuals, family and community.” (Mulholland & Tremblay, forthcoming, p. 6)
- “Aboriginal peoples face unique barriers to their financial wellness, however. Historically, trading, bartering, and communal distributions of wealth were central to the allocation of food, shelter, clothing, and tools. These systems were disrupted by colonization and assimilation policies and practices, including Canada’s residential school system.” (Mulholland & Tremblay, forthcoming, p. 6)
- In the past five years there has been an advancement of the key components and priorities of financial wellness. While it was developed in the USA, the framework is now being adopted by Canadian leaders in financial wellness including the Aboriginal Financial Officers (AFOA) and Prosper Canada. The Framework includes 5 pillars of Financial Empowerment:
  o 1. Financial Information education and counselling
  o 2. Help accessing income boosting benefits and tax credits
  o 3. Safe and affordable financial products and services
  o 4. Access to savings and asset building opportunities
  o 5. Consumer awareness and protection.
- “American research has revealed that the children of low income families benefit from financial capability interventions over the life cycle: Key markers of financial wellness (e.g. being banked, having a strong credit score, and having some liquid savings and other financial assets) have a significant impact on whether people with low and modest incomes can achieve upward economic mobility for themselves and their children.” (Mulholland & Tremblay, forthcoming, p. 4)

**Conceptualizing Indigenous Economies in Manitoba and Brandon**
- AFOA (2015) analyzes five pillars of Financial Literacy in terms of their relevance to a number of Aboriginal age demographic groups. The Pillars are: ‘Planning ahead; managing financial affairs; public and private benefits; financial products and services; protection from fraud and abuse’. The pillars are likewise adopted and supported by the Financial Consumer Agency of Canada and Prosper Canada. (AFOA, 2015, p. 10)
- AFOA conceives of Indigenous financial wellness in a much broader policy and institutional context that will build systems and foundations for self-governance and act as protective factors, promoting Indigenous advancement in four key areas according to the Medicine Wheel: Financial capability/literacy; higher incomes; financial inclusion; and financial health/asset building. (Mulholland & Tremblay, forthcoming, pp. 18-21).
- “Overall, Inuit and Métis and First Nations Communities exhibit a predominantly collective approach to economic development that is closely tied to each group’s traditional lands, its identity as a nation, and its desire to be self-governing. This collective development approach is intended to serve three purposes: the attainment of economic self-sufficiency,
the improvement of socio-economic circumstance, and the preservation and strengthening of traditional culture, values and languages.” (Anderson, 1999, pp. 13-14)

**Indigenous Money: Facts about Brandon**

- 65% of Brandon’s Indigenous People have income of under $29,999 (Statistics Canada NHS Aboriginal Population Profile, 2011)
- 51.8% of Indigenous Children in Brandon (Ages 6 and under) live in low-income households. 16.4% of non-Indigenous children of the same age live in low-income households. Overall 36.4% of the Indigenous population lives in low-income households (12.2% of non-Indigenous population). (Statistics Canada NHS Aboriginal Population Profile, 2011)
- The 2013 living wage for a two-parent, two-child family was $13.41/hour in Brandon (up from $11.10/hour in 2009). (Brandon: CCPA Manitoba, p. 5)
- 31% of Brandon’s Indigenous people have an income between $30,000 to $59,999; 4% of Brandon’s Indigenous people have an income between $60,000 to $99,999. (Statistics Canada, 2011 NHS Aboriginal Population Profile)
- 2011 Canadian Census data for Winnipeg and Brandon show that:
  - Low income rates are double or higher for Aboriginal population
  - Low income rates highest among Aboriginal women
  - In Winnipeg and Brandon, half of all Aboriginal children under age six are in low income
  - Early childhood success and school readiness may be adversely affected by low income
  - Most Aboriginal people receive the majority of their income from market income sources
  - Income gaps between Aboriginal and Non-Aboriginal population are smallest in Winnipeg, more pronounced in Brandon
  - Gaps in income between Aboriginal and Non-Aboriginal population narrow as education levels improve (Ultra Insights Planning and Research Services, 2014, p. 10)
- “Members of First Nations and other Aboriginal groups are more likely than other Canadians to be unbanked (without a basic deposit account) or underbanked (with an account but do not use it). Estimates of the unbanked among Canada’s Aboriginal peoples range from 4.2% (approximately double the rate for Canadians overall), from the 2009 Canadian Financial Capability Survey, to as high as 15%. This rate is now likely higher.” (Buckland & Dong, 2008, p. 253)

**What is the Vulnerability Context? What holds people back?**

- Financial Literacy and information needs were identified in a recent study by AFOA Canada (AFOA, 2015). Indigenous respondents’ top four priorities for information related to life course decision making: retirement, home ownership, job loss and saving to pay for future education. (Buckland & Dong, 2008, p. 6)
- “For most households, savings and assets are the critical first line of defense against emergencies, unforeseen expenses, and income interruptions. Families that have adequate savings and assets can often successfully weather such setbacks, but households that lack
this security are financially vulnerable and at risk of falling into poverty.” (Prosper Canada, 2014, p. 4)

- “Financial stress is associated with lowered self-esteem, an increasingly pessimistic outlook on life, and reduced mental health, particularly an increase in depression and hostility. There is also a link between financial stress and suicide and alcohol consumption, likely as a result of the increased level of depression. Financial stress is also associated with declining physical health such as an increase in headaches, stomach aches, and insomnia.” (Davis & Mantler, 2004, p. vi-vi)

- “Low-income parents have obvious difficulties when it comes to providing a supportive and engaging environment for their children. Children from low-income families are less likely to do well at school, have lower literacy levels and are more likely as adults to suffer from job insecurity, under-employment and poor health.” (Jarosiewicz, 2013, p. 8)

Success Factors & Key Directions in Indigenous Money

- “Indigenous peoples understand life’s journey as a sacred path from childhood, youth, adult to the elderly - it is a lifelong continuous process. Life’s success and wealth is celebrated through feasts, sharing, and family. Economists use the life-cycle hypothesis to understand individual consumption patterns, and explain consumption and saving behaviour to maintain stable lifestyles. Sociologists employ a life course approach or theory to analyze individual’s structural, social, and cultural contexts. The life course approach is useful in understanding how early life influences future decisions and events. Financial literacy utilizes the life cycle to emphasize the importance of delivering the right services, materials, and supports at the right time throughout one’s life cycle. The long-term outcome is for individuals and families to achieve financial wellbeing through continuous financial education. Financial literacy needs vary over the course of one’s life. A life cycle approach to learning and financial planning will be able to account for and address these changing needs. A life cycle approach to financial education and financial planning should incorporate an individual’s values, goals, and personal choices, prepare him or her for major life events, and account for life cycle conditions and needs.” (Brascoupe, Weatherdon, & Tremblay, 2013, p. 14)

- “The top three promising practices dimensions across the four country programs included partnerships, culture, and community. This pointed to the need: to develop partnerships with relevant bodies and organizations; and to design and deliver culturally appropriate and relevant programs and materials that are community designed and developed for Indigenous populations.” (Brascoupe, Weatherdon & Tremblay, 2013, p. 7)

- “Emphasizing the importance of culture has been identified as another way to enhance financial literacy training programs for Indigenous Peoples. Each Indigenous person/community has different cultures, values, and beliefs. Financial literacy programs need to respect and reflect the local culture. Indigenous Peoples will be more likely to be attracted to financial literacy programs that simultaneously promote culture while providing practical education about finances. There are a variety of strategies organizations can employ to ensure they maintain a respect for Indigenous cultures.” These include “cultural relevance... knowledge translation... [and] cultural safety.” (Brascoupe, Weatherdon & Tremblay, 2013, p. 18)
Innovations and Promising Practices

- SEED Winnipeg supports a wide range of Financial Empowerment services in partnership with Indigenous organizations in Winnipeg including: client access to ID and basic banking services; offers ‘Manage your Money Workshops’; an asset building/ matched savings program, and its facilitators and program graduates deliver the Money Stories financial literacy sessions to a range of non-profit organizations who serve Indigenous community members.
- The Winnipeg Boldness project is working with SEED Winnipeg to promote their participants’ access to the Canada Learning Bond and its related Canada Educational Savings Grant.
- “AFOA conceives of Indigenous financial wellness in a much broader policy and institutional context that will build systems and foundations for self-governance and act as protective factors, promoting Indigenous advancement in four key areas according to the Medicine Wheel: Financial capability/literacy; higher incomes; financial inclusion; and financial health/asset building.” (Mulholland & Tremblay, forthcoming; see diagram below)

Further information about Asset Building and the importance of embedding financial empowerment into front line case management supports:

- Financial asset building is key to moving people out of poverty. “Financial stability is overall economic security that can sustain an individual or family for months and years, not just days and weeks. Income and income supports such as housing subsidies and public benefits are necessary but not sufficient for overall financial stability. A household also requires financial knowledge and access to affordable financial products and services to build cushions against financial shocks and downturns. Significant levels of debt work against financial stability. A helpful measure of financial security is the concept of “asset poverty,” which is not having enough assets or net worth to survive for three months after an interruption of income.
- The Corporation for Enterprise Development’s recent report, Building Economic Security in America’s Cities, shows that asset poverty rates are much higher across the board than income poverty rates, suggesting that a focus on assets, rather than simply income, will yield more lasting impact. Moreover, there is an iterative quality to income and asset distress, with predatory businesses taking unfair and often illegal advantage of those desperate for quick solutions. It is this platform of overall financial stability that boosts the effectiveness and improves the outcomes of the delivery of traditional social service programming—the “Supervitamin effect”.

2 US evidence: In 1991, Michael Sherraden published a seminal book, Assets and the Poor, positing the importance of building assets while boosting income. Since then, asset building has emerged as a significant and innovative approach to moving people out of poverty to greater self-sufficiency by providing supports and services to help them keep more of their income to grow savings and assets. Although the field has expanded to incorporate thousands of savings, banking, and asset building efforts nationwide, to a large degree, it has remained a boutique industry within the broader social service and antipoverty programming in this country. With the entrance of large municipal players into the field, there is an opportunity to integrate their strategies for financial stability into city services. Municipal Financial Empowerment: A Supervitamin for public programs. (p. 5-6) NYC Department of Consumer Affairs.
Figure 2 - AFOA - Financial Wellness in First Nations Communities (Credit AFOA and Prosper Canada (2017) Forthcoming).
Section 6: Health
Brief 10: Indigenous Health

Introduction

• “While there is diversity among First Nations, Inui and Métis populations there are significant overall health and economic disparities between the Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal population:
  o Aboriginal people are much more likely to live in poor health and die prematurely
  o Aboriginal people have a higher burden of chronic and of infectious disease.
  o Aboriginal children are more likely to die in the first year of life
  o Aboriginal people are more likely to live in poverty, which has a domino effect on other aspects of their lives. They are more likely to go hungry, to suffer from poor nutrition and obesity, and to live in overcrowded, substandard housing.
  o Aboriginal people are less likely to graduate from high school, and more likely to be unemployed.” (Health Council of Canada, 2011, p. 4)
• “The health of Aboriginal people residing in urban areas is not well understood. It is a demographically and culturally diverse population that is also relatively mobile in ways that do not fit dominant migration models. Furthermore, data describing the population of Aboriginal people residing in urban areas are sparse.” (Place, 2012, p. 7)
• “Women and children are particularly vulnerable to poor health, and there is an inadequate level of services that address family violence, childcare and urban transition. For example, there are few culturally sensitive programs for women who are victims of violence and trying to transition safely with children to an urban area. Likewise, more services are needed that address income support and mental health (e.g., addictions and suicide prevention).” (Place, 2012, p. 34)
• "Today, there are four generations of First Nations residential school survivors in Canada who may have transmitted the trauma they experienced to their own children and the children of their children, and to non-descendants by way of indirect trauma effects at the level of the community." (Elias et al., 2012, p. 1561)
• “55.8% of Adults [on-Reserve] said they have less access to health services compared to the general Canadian population. The top three barriers to accessing health care among adults were: 51.3% said wait list is too long; 28.4% said Doctor or Nurse is not available in their area; 21.1% said the health care provided is inadequate.” (Assembly of Manitoba Chiefs & First Nations Information Governance Centre, 2010, p. 16)

Conceptualizing Indigenous Health in Urban Manitoba

• “Aboriginal groups in Canada are diverse, and while there is no singular definition of Aboriginal wellness there are several commonalities in health perspectives. For instance, many Aboriginal groups view health as not merely the absence of disease, as is emphasized in bio-medical models, but as the balance and interconnectedness in health and well-being of spirit, mind, (emotion) and body with individual, (family), community and environment (Ootoova et al., 2001; Edge & McCallum, 2006).

  The Ojibwe phrase “Mino-Bimaadiziwin” or “Healthy Way of Life” describes this balance:

  “One must always be aware of the interrelationship between all beings to ensure Mino-Bimaadiziwin, the healthy way of life. This includes one’s relationships with
the surrounding environment, surrounding beings, and the inner physical, emotional, intellectual and spiritual needs of the human condition (ojibwe.org).”
(Public Health Agency of Canada, 2015, p. 6)

• “More broadly, this study also points to the importance of considering rights as a social determinant of Indigenous health and, in particular, in further exploring how disrespect for Indigenous rights in urban areas impacts health outcomes. The findings of this analysis are thus in keeping with global discussions, such as those summarized at the WHO’s International Symposium on the Social Determinants of Indigenous Health, in highlighting respect for Indigenous rights as integral to any effort to address Indigenous health inequities. In the context of Indigenous peoples at the global level, relationships between rights and health have been explored at the intersection of human rights and health equity research (Hunt, 2006; Mann et al., 1994). They have focused importantly on respect for human rights as a precursor to health, by fostering societal conditions that promote and produce health (Chapman, 2010). This study shows that these links have salience in the context of Aboriginal peoples in Canada, as it was suggested that Aboriginal rights, specifically disrespect for them in urban areas, may be linked with health by way of their impacts on immediate determinants of health such as material circumstances and psychosocial factors.”
(Senese & Wilson, 2013, p. 227)

Indigenous Health: Facts about Brandon

• “Financial stress is associated with lowered self-esteem, an increasingly pessimistic outlook on life, and reduced mental health, particularly an increase in depression and hostility. There is also a link between financial stress and suicide and alcohol consumption, likely as a result of the increased level of depression. Financial stress is also associated with declining physical health such as an increase in headaches, stomach aches, and insomnia.” (Davis & Mantler, 2004, v-vi)

• In Manitoba in 2012, Aboriginal people continue to have poorer health and that health services continue to be inadequate in terms of availability and acceptability. In other words, there are still too few readily accessible and culturally appropriate services in Canada’s urban areas. (Place, 2015, p. 34)

• Women and children are particularly vulnerable to poor health, and there is an inadequate level of services that address family violence, childcare and urban transition. (Place, 2015, p. 34)

• “In Canada, over 54 percent of Aboriginal peoples are urban and change their place of residence at a higher rate than the non-Aboriginal population. High rates of mobility may affect the delivery and use of health services.” (Snyder & Wilson, 2012, p. 2420)

• “The best estimate is that the current overall average rate of problem / pathological gambling is in the 10% to 20% range and is at least 4 times higher than found in non-Aboriginal populations.” (Williams, Belanger, & Prusak, 2012, p. 725)

• “The top three barriers to accessing health care among adults were: 51.3% said wait list is too long; 28.4% said Doctor or Nurse is not available in their area; 21.1% said the health care provided is inadequate.” (Assembly of Manitoba Chiefs, 2010)

• 16% of Indigenous respondents in Manitoba rate their health as ‘fair’ or ‘poor’. (Statistics Canada APS, 2012, table 577-0001)
• 26.1% of Indigenous respondents in Manitoba rate their health as ‘good’; 54.6% of Indigenous respondents in Manitoba rate their health as ‘very good or excellent’. (Statistics Canada APS, 2012, table 577-0001)

What is the Vulnerability Context? What holds people back?
• “Mino-Bimaadiziwin bears some resemblance to the social determinants of health (SDOH) approach, which helps to conceptualize the links between sociopolitical factors and inequities in health status. Poor education, poverty, inadequate housing, food insecurity and social isolation have been linked to long-term stress implicated in specific conditions such as cardiovascular disease, diabetes, mental-illness and suicide (Minore & Katt, 2007; White & Jodoin, 2007; Bombay, Matheson & Anisman, 2009; Mikkonen & Raphael, 2010).” (Public Health Agency of Canada, 2015, p. 6)
• “In Canada, over 54 percent of Aboriginal peoples are urban and change their place of residence at a higher rate than the non-Aboriginal population. High rates of mobility may affect the delivery and use of health services... Using data from Statistics Canada’s 2006 Aboriginal Peoples Survey, this analysis demonstrates that mobility is a significant predisposing correlate of health service use and that the impact of mobility on health care use varies by urban setting. In Toronto, urban newcomers were more likely to use a physician or nurse compared to long-term residents. This was in direct contrast to the effect of residency on physician and nurse use in Winnipeg... This has important implications for how health services are planned and delivered to urban Aboriginal movers on a local, and potentially global, scale.” (Snyder & Wilson, 2012, p. 2420)

Success Factors & Key Directions
• “The 2002 Romanow Report recommended actions to: “Consolidate fragmented funding to take the best advantage of the potential funds available; create new models to co-ordinate and deliver health care services and ensure Aboriginal health needs are addressed; adapt health programs and services to the cultural, social, economic and political circumstances unique to different Aboriginal groups; and give Aboriginal people a direct voice in how health care services are designed and delivered.” (Romanow Report, 2002, p. 212, as cited in MacKinnon, 2005, p. S15)
• Public Health Agency of Canada defines six (6) basic operational concepts for use in the design of Indigenous health practices and the documentation of ‘way tried and true’. These concepts are: community based; wholistic approach; integration of Indigenous cultural knowledge; building on community strengths and needs; partnership and collaboration; and effectiveness. (Public Health Agency of Canada, 2015, p. 11-14)
• “Self-determination within Indigenous urban communities, and on a smaller scale, ownership for individuals, is a key determinant of health for Indigenous individuals and communities; this was made clear through the analysis of the research findings and is also supported within the literature. This research also demonstrates that access to traditional healing can enhance ownership for community members. These findings emphasize that there is a continued and growing need for support to aid urban Indigenous peoples in accessing traditional health care supports.” (Auger, Howell, & Gomes, 2016, p. e393)

Innovations and Promising Practices
• Strengthening Families Maternal and Child Health Program (SF-MCH)
o “As the name denotes the emphasis of the program is “Strengthening Families” through the delivery of home visiting services and through the delivery of a curriculum that draws on the cultural strengths of the community and family. SF-MCH Manitoba is a partnership co-management model and a province-wide, family-focused home visiting program for pregnant women, fathers, and families of infants and young children from 0-6 years of age. The Assembly of Manitoba Chiefs (AMC) and First Nations Inuit Health (FNHI) have agreed on a co-management structure with FNHI providing the administration and funding directly to the communities, and AMC providing the regional support to the pilot sites, with the First Nations Advisory Committee overseeing the overall implementation of the program.” (Health Council of Canada, 2011, p. 25)

- Cree Health Advocate – Winnipeg Regional Health Authority
  o “Various models to help Cree-speaking patients understand the hospital environment.
  o Mobile model has an advocate moving from hospital to hospital.
  o Navigator model assists patients to navigate the system to ensure they get the most appropriate services.
  o The helper is integrated as part of the health care team in the hospital.
  o Provides education, grief support, coping strategies.
  o Works well in urban environments.
  o Why is this a promising practice?
    o Holistic
    o Patient-centred
    o Accessible” (Health Council of Canada, 2013, p. 71)

- Women’s Health Clinic is a feminist, community-based health clinic in Winnipeg, Manitoba
  o “Offers a range of services to women of all ages; including well women care, health consultations, mental health counselling, birth control and unplanned pregnancy counselling, abortion services, midwifery services, a birth centre, post-partum and mothering care, pregnancy testing, sexually transmitted infection testing, health information and education, and community and health policy advocacy.
  o Sherpa mothers act as mentors for mothering support (e.g. post-partum adjustments).
  o Includes a teen clinic (drop-in, confidential, young women and men 13-19 years).
  o Holistic approach to health emphasizes prevention, education and action.
  o Programs and services are designed to encourage and empower people to take care of their own health.
  o Challenges include waiting lists for some services.
  o Why is this a promising practice?
    o Long standing community clinic
    o Leadership in women’s health
    o Client-centered approach to care (Health Council of Canada, 2013, p. 58)
Section 7: Vulnerability Context
Brief 11: Vulnerability Context

This paper curates information and analysis about the trends, cycles, systems and shocks that contribute to the vulnerability of the urban Indigenous population in Brandon.

Systems

Colonial history has created a colonial policy context

- “Colonialism remains an ongoing process, shaping both the structure and the quality of the relationship between the settlers and Indigenous peoples. At their height, the European empires laid claim to most of the earth’s surface and controlled the seas. Numerous arguments were advanced to justify such extravagant interventions into the lands and lives of other peoples. These were largely elaborations on two basic concepts: 1) the Christian god had given the Christian nations the right to colonize the lands they ‘discovered’ as long as they converted the Indigenous populations; and 2) the Europeans were bringing the benefits of civilization (a concept that was intertwined with Christianity) to the ‘heathen.’ In short, it was contended that people were being colonized for their own benefit, either in this world or the next.” (Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada, 2015, pp. 45-46).

- “Most policy research fails to identify the underlying issues that to this day deeply influence the Canadian state-Aboriginal relationship… it is colonialism, with its constituent elements of racism and unbalanced power relations, that is acting subtly behind the scenes of contemporary urban Aboriginal public policy in small Manitoba cities.” (Moore et al., 2011, p. 17)

- A “purely economic definition disguises the true depth and effects of colonialism. To facilitate colonialism meant that the relation between colonizer and the colonized was locked into a hierarchy of difference deeply resistant to fair and equitable exchanges, whether economic, cultural or social.” (Ashcroft, Griffiths, & Tiffin, 2000, p. 46, as cited in Moore et al., 2011, p. 20)

Colonialism is an unresolved trauma, effective solutions for which are poorly understood from a policy perspective

- “The intergenerational impact of the residential school system has left some families without strong role models for parenting.” (Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada, 2015, p. 144)

- “Indigenous “First Nations” communities have consistently associated their disproportionate rates of psychiatric distress with historical experiences of European colonization. This emphasis on the socio-psychological legacy of colonization within tribal communities has occasioned increasingly widespread consideration of what has been termed historical trauma within First Nations contexts. In contrast to personal experiences of a traumatic nature, the concept of historical trauma calls attention to the complex, collective, cumulative, and intergenerational psychosocial impacts that resulted from the depredations of past colonial subjugation.” (Gone, 2013, p. 683)

- “Although widely accepted among Indigenous communities and researchers, there is a need for empirical attention to the question of whether historical trauma can have effects generations after they occurred. By using this example of a more contemporary government policy of acculturation we were able to link the harmful effects of relocation across
generations. Were data available, we believe that an even stronger case could be made for more insidious acculturation policies such as boarding schools on intergenerational linkages and influence. The process is the erosion of intergenerational influences. Grandparents were separated from their sons and daughters and grandchildren. They could not teach the cultural ways of parenting by providing appropriate role models of strong parents and elders. Their children, in turn, were more at risk of demoralization (depressive symptoms) and substance abuse. This eroded their abilities as parent, so that the next generation was more susceptible to early substance use and delinquent behaviors. And so it goes until the cycle is broken.” (Walls & Whitbeck, 2012, p. 1289)

- “Providers of contemporary indigenous healing programmes are drawing simultaneously on trauma discourse, which is seen to legitimate individual social suffering, and older therapeutic forms centred on sharing local social histories to restore intergenerational continuities and collective identity. But these invocations of historical trauma may continue the colonial discourse of mental health and social welfare professionals, who blamed indigenous parenting practices for children’s social problems and failure to assimilate. Some contemporary mental health and child development professionals have invoked parents’ and grandparents’ transmission of historical trauma in ways which construct indigenous families as pathological, promote an oversimplified, universalizing understanding of Canadian colonialism, and divert attention from the contemporary continuation of colonial structures and relations.” (Maxwell, 2014, p. 407)

Jurisdictional confusion and inadequate funding results in inadequate service for Indigenous people in urban municipalities

- “The level and quality, as well as accessibility of services have always been inadequate to deal with the problems of the Aboriginal urban population. Cutbacks to some areas of social programming over the last fifteen years as well as confusion over jurisdictional responsibility have not helped to improve the situation.” (Carter et al., 2004, p. 13)

- “Whenever possible municipal governments use funds from other sources to address Aboriginal service needs and participate extensively in programs that are cost shared with other orders of government. They also seek funds from foundations, the private sector and community fund raising. However, the level of support provided by municipal governments cannot even come close to addressing the needs of Aboriginal people. Without additional sources of revenue it will be difficult for municipal governments to provide higher levels of support.” (Carter et al., 2004, p. v)

- “Although, the division of powers in the 1867 Constitution Act was complete, and was integral in crafting a strong base on which to build assimilationist policy, its authors could not have predicted the influx of Aboriginal peoples to cities, nor the issues that such an influx would represent. As a result, no level of Canadian government seems to want to assume responsibility for urban Aboriginal peoples, creating a jurisdictional vacuum in which each level of government tries to avoid responsibility. (Hanselmann & Gibbins, 2003; Hanselmann, 2001; Graham and Peters, 2002)

- Perhaps one of the most critical aspects of this situation is that debates about jurisdiction appear not to involve Aboriginal peoples at all. These debates are instead conceived of as debates over which legitimate – or dominant – level of government holds sway. The debate, then, is not neutral, but is itself an expression of colonial power relationships wherein the dominant settler governments hold the future of colonized Aboriginal people in their hands.
It is in this sense that the current jurisdictional indecision is not only a product of colonialism, but also reinforces colonialism.” (Moore et al., 2011, p. 24)

• “For organizations operating programs given to them by government, funding was always a significant obstacle. Most funding was obtained on a short-term basis with strict evaluation attached. Programs were not guaranteed to run more than one year, as funding rarely spanned more than that period. In some cases, very valuable programs simply had to be abandoned for lack of funding. Long-term funding would allow for long-term goals to be established and long-term objectives reached. Short-term funding breeds the very opposite. Service providers spent a great deal of time applying for funding and meeting the evaluation criteria that comes with funding, instead of spending that time administering those programs... Using funding as a means of colonial control, Canadian government is clearly maintaining an unbalanced power relationship wherein Aboriginal service organization are given little control of critical resources.” (Moore et al., 2011, p. 30)

Lack of policy recognition for culturally relevant or self-determined service models in areas including education, healing, housing

• “Efforts at adding Aboriginal content to curricula usually consist of adding units designed to “enrich” existing curriculum content instead of changing the core assumptions, values, and logic of the curriculum itself. Meaningful and relevant education for Aboriginal students, however, requires fundamental changes to create a curriculum that is rooted in Aboriginal understanding of the world, not only in content, but also in the teaching and learning activities which are in harmony with the life experience of Aboriginal students (Augustine 1998, Munns, Lawson & Mootz 2000, Tharp & Yamauchi 1994). It is only when Aboriginal students find a sense of place and belonging in the school system that their achievement levels will improve (Antone 2000, Augustine 1998, Baskin 2002, Cardinal 1999, Battiste 2002, Greenway 2002, Kirkness 1999, Manitoba Education and Youth 2003, Pewewardy 2002).“ (Ledoux, 2006, p. 267)

• “There does not appear to be room for the integration of culture and health within places of treatment. There is a lack of recognition of both culturally-specific causes of substance of abuse (i.e., the legacy of colonialism) and culturally-specific approaches to health and healing (Brady, 1995). We argue that the indifference to Aboriginal specificity and the belittling of Aboriginal approaches to healing are more aligned to the concept of white privilege, where intent is less obvious, rather than to outright and demonstrable institutional racism within the treatment recovery system. In other words, there is no explicit denial of Aboriginals needs, but rather an indifference to them that speaks to the normalizing and embodied nature of white privilege. We thus find a situation where culture is potentially central to treatment but divorced in most services.” (DeVerteuil & Wilson, 2010, p. 505)

• “In Canada and elsewhere, Indigenous notions of home, health, and even place have been found to be qualitatively distinct from those of non-Indigenous people in many respects. For example, studies of Indigenous people worldwide have continued to emphasize the therapeutic importance of connection to land, community, and family (King et al., 2009; Moreton-Robinson, 2003). Others have also emphasized the therapeutic relationship between traditional healing practices and Indigenous peoples' experience of health and wellbeing (Iwasaki et al., 2005; Brady, 1995).
Despite these insights, in practice, the recognition of Indigeneity in urban housing policy and practice is often lacking.” (Alaazi et al., 2015, pp. 30-31)

**Lack of data or corresponding policy to reflect urban Indigenous experience and identities**

- “Researchers note that urban Aboriginal cultural identities are not simply transferred from earlier traditions or from remote Aboriginal communities, but draw instead on cultural traditions and identities that are consciously and systemically being reconstructed differently in cities (Newhouse, 2011; Proulx, 2006).” (Peters et al., 2014, p. 289)
- “No matter how reasonable it may be to posit a distinctive urban identity, well-documented Canadian jurisdictional peccadilloes around federal government interpretations of section 91(24) of the British North America Act (see Graham and Peters 2002) have effectively precluded official recognition of urban Aboriginality as a distinctive identity. This remains the case despite the half million of us who have lived and continue to live in Canada’s cities, and the decades-long legacy of urban Aboriginal community-building in often inhospitable terrain.” (Andersen, 2013, p. 47)
- “Given their distinctiveness, and given the federal government’s elevated interest in urban Aboriginality as a distinctive arena of policy interest (and thus intervention), it only makes sense to produce a stronger, more nuanced evidence base from which to undertake such intervention. An Aboriginal Peoples Survey-based urban supplement represents a useful way to strengthen the existing knowledge base.” (Anderson, 2013, p. 64)

**Systemic racism – e.g. implicit bias increases incarceration**

- A number of the disproportionate and adverse impacts that characterize the dealings of Aboriginal people in the justice system:
  - More than half of the inmates of Manitoba’s jails are Aboriginal
  - Aboriginal accused are more likely to be denied bail
  - Aboriginal people spend more time in pre-trial detention than do non-Aboriginal people
  - Aboriginal accused are more likely to be charged with multiple offences than are non-Aboriginal accused
  - Lawyers spend less time with their Aboriginal clients than with non-Aboriginal clients
  - Aboriginal offenders are more than twice as likely as non-Aboriginal people to be incarcerated

- “The over-representation of Aboriginal people occurs at virtually every step of the judicial process, from the charging of individuals to their sentencing.” (The Aboriginal Justice Implementation Commission, 2001)
- “There is a steady increase in the number of people who have been refused by Legal Aid Manitoba, especially for women who are victims of domestic violence.” (Bennett et al., 2008)
- Indigenous people are not only more likely to be homeless, they are more likely to suffer unsheltered homelessness (as opposed to emergency of provisional housing). (Nino et al., 2016)
**Trends**

**Barriers to accessibility of community supports and services**

- At least 1400 homeless people were documented on the night of October 15, 2015, 71.1% (995) of these individuals were Indigenous. (Nino et al., 2016)
- The health of Aboriginal people residing in urban areas is not well understood. (Place, 2012)
- Food insecurity is prevalent among many urban Indigenous populations in Canada, however little information is available in this area. (Tambay & Catlin, 1995, as cited in Cidro et al., 2015, p. 27)
- The distinctive cultural or political concerns of Indigenous peoples have yet to be completely embedded in mainstream housing development or support activities. (Walker, 2006, p. 391; Deane & Smoke, 2010, p. 51)
- In Winnipeg, research participants identified three key areas “pertinent to Indigenous food security”: (1) growing, harvesting, preparing and eating cultural food as ceremony, (2) cultural food as a part of connection to land through reciprocity and (3) re-learning IFS [Indigenous Food Sovereignty] practices to address food insecurity. (Cidro, Peters, & Sinclair, 2014, p. 4)
- In urban settings, Indigenous Food Security is often encumbered by a lack of access to traditional territories outside of the city. (Cidro & Martens, 2015, p. 13)
- Aboriginal people continue to have poorer health and that health services continue to be inadequate in terms of availability and acceptability. (Place, 2012)

**Criminalization of indigenous people and poverty**

- Aboriginal offenders serve a higher proportion of their sentences before being released on parole. (Government of Canada, 2014)
- In 2013, In Manitoba, 61% of the inmates were Aboriginal compared to 9% in the provincial population. In the other provinces/territories, the proportion of Aboriginal persons incarcerated ranged from twice to almost nine times their proportion of the provincial/territorial population. (Government of Canada, 2013)

**Lack of access to supports to participate: child care, food, housing, addictions services.**

- Winnipeg Plan to End Youth Homelessness identifies systemic factors creating vulnerability to homelessness including Child and Family Services; Justice, Health, Mental Health and Addictions, Education and EIA). (hereandnowwinnipeg.ca, n.d., p. 12)
- Socio-economic issues (i.e. Childcare, addictions, housing, transportation, racism and justice). (Hall, 2015)
- Housing costs in Manitoba have increased above the average Provincial inflation rate every year for the past five (5) years, from a minimum of 0.3% (2012) above average inflation to a maximum of 1.1% above average (2014). (Statistics Canada Manitoba Consumer Price Index, 2016)
- Although 2016 saw inflation on foodstuffs slow to 0.3% since 2015, the five-year trend remains much higher than inflation generally: 2.2% average 2012-2016 compared to 1.5% annually for all other items. (Statistics Canada Manitoba Consumer Price Index, 2016)
• Indigenous people are about twice as likely as the rest of the population to live in housing in need of significant repairs. (Statistics Canada National Health Survey, 2011, as cited in Ultra Insights Planning and Research Services, 2014, Table 28).

• “According to Willows et al (2011) 33% of Indigenous households are food insecure compared to 9% of non-Indigenous households.” (Cidro et al., 2015, p. 27)

• “ Household food insecurity is linked to ongoing challenges with low income or poverty. While many programs offer subsidies and tax cuts to low-income households, they do not prevent low income: rather they act to reduce the effects of low income. A forward thinking strategy would be to create a more integrated approach to address low income and poverty issues... a coordinated plan of action and budget, a government accountability structure, and a set of poverty indicators.” (Howard & Edge, 2013, p. 2, as cited in Government of Manitoba, 2013)

Widening Education Gap

• “The education gap is widening for Indigenous children in primary and elementary school...this trend continuing up to Grade 7.” (Moscou, Rempel, Sinclair, & Ramsey, 2016)

• “Slightly more than 60% of Aboriginal Canadians do not have the literacy skills necessary to participate fully in the current knowledge-based economy.” (Gulati, 2013, p. 3)

• Overall levels of Indigenous educational attainment in the adult population are improving but continue to lag behind the non-Indigenous population. (Ultra Insights Planning and Research Services, 2014)

• Urban Indigenous adults tend to attend school later and have different patterns of educational participation. (Ultra Insights Planning and Research Services, 2014)

• The level of Indigenous adults without a high school diploma have remained high over the last 3 censuses. (Ultra Insights Planning and Research Services, 2014)

Lack of growth of incomes

• Unemployment rates remain high: The Indigenous unemployment rate increased from 11.8% in 2006 to 12.4% in 2011. More than twice the level of the non-Indigenous population. (Ultra Insights Planning and Research Services, 2014, p. 78)

• “The data on labour participation rates show that Aboriginal youth participation rates are more than fourteen percentage points lower than those for Non Aboriginal youth. This is a substantial portion of the young adult population at a stage in their lives where transitions to education or employment can be crucially important in achieving sustainable livelihoods.” (Ultra Insights Planning and Research Services, 2014, p. 85)

• Attachment to the labour force and success in the labour force appears much lower for Indigenous females with limited education. A number of factors, including limited job opportunities and low wages may explain these findings. (Ultra Insights Planning and Research Services, 2014, p. 92)
Cycles

Inter-generational trauma creates a cycle of social exclusion, crisis, violence, addictions, and depletion of resources

- Twenty-six percent reported a history of suicide thoughts, and an abuse history was significantly associated with this outcome. A suicide attempt history was reported by 14% of the sub-sample, and an abuse history was also significantly associated with this outcome. (Elias et al. 2012)
- Abuse was reported by 37%... Thirty percent off the sub-sample reported a history of suicide thoughts. ...Sixteen percent reported a history of suicide attempts. (Ibid)

Mobility patterns – within and between cities, and to the land

- Mobility complicates attachment and weakens participation in mainstream delivery models of education, employment and health.
- Indigenous peoples’ mobility affects housing and health care. (Snyder & Wilson, 2012)
- Delivering low-cost housing programs at the neighbourhood level can be difficult given the higher mobility of Indigenous target populations. (Norris & Clatworthy, 2003, as cited in Walker, 2006, p. 401)

Life Cycle Patterns

- “Parents may fear that the aim of the mainstream educational institutions is to assimilate their children.” (Moscou et al., 2016, p. 30)
- Women and children are particularly vulnerable to poor health, and there is an inadequate level of services that address family violence, childcare and urban transition. For example, there are few culturally sensitive programs for women who are victims of violence and trying to transition safely with children to an urban area. Likewise, more services are needed that address income support and mental health (e.g., addictions and suicide prevention). (Place, 2012)
- Today, there are four generations of First Nations residential school survivors in Canada who may have transmitted the trauma they experienced to their own children and the children of their children, and to non-descendants by way of indirect trauma effects at the level of the community. (Elias et al., 2012)
- Having attended a residential school or having a family member attend a residential school positively correlated with leaving school early (Lamb, 2014)

Shocks

Indigenous peoples continue to suffer significant shocks and trauma at rates higher than non-indigenous people: abuse, suicide, domestic violence, incarceration

- “More than 70 per cent of inmates in Manitoba jails identify as aboriginal, despite only representing about 15 per cent of the province’s total population... This over-representation has been increasing.” (Marcoux & Barghout, 2015)
- Some 20% of Aboriginal respondents reported being victimized compared to 9% of non-Aboriginals (Statistics Canada, 2011b). Aboriginal women report that they are two-and-one-half times as likely as non-aboriginal women to have been victims of spousal abuse (15% versus 6%) during the preceding five years. (Easton et al., 2014)
• Winnipeg has the second highest homicide rate in the country, 3.29 per 100,000 population. (Milandinovic & Mulligan, 2014, p. 3)
• Indigenous women in Manitoba are 8.5 times more likely than non-Indigenous women to be murdered...a murder rate of 7.16 per 100k Indigenous women compared to 0.85 per 100k non-Indigenous. (Statistics Canada, 2015, Table 8)
• "Nearly half (48.1%) of [residential school] attendees reported an abuse history. Age 28-44 was significantly associated with this history, as well as negative effects of residential school attendance." (Elias et al., 2012)
• Young Indigenous people were especially hard hit by the 2008/2009 economic downturn. Participation rates fell declines were steepest in Quebec, Manitoba and Alberta. (The Aboriginal Labour Force Analysis Series. Aboriginal People and the Labour Market: Estimates from the Labour Force Survey, 2008-2010)
Factors That Hold Manitoba Urban Indigenous Peoples Back: A Context That Creates Vulnerability

**Systems**
- the formal and informal ways that society functions
- the biases and forms of discrimination that reduce people’s opportunities, e.g. racism, sexism, social security
  - Colonial history has created a colonial policy context
  - Colonialism is an unresolved trauma, effective solutions for which are poorly understood from a policy perspective
  - Jurisdictional confusion and inadequate funding results in inadequate service for Indigenous people in urban municipalities
  - Lack of policy recognition for culturally relevant or self-determined service models in areas including education, healing, housing
  - Lack of data or corresponding policy to reflect urban Indigenous experience and identities
  - Systemic racism — e.g. implicit bias increases incarceration

**Shocks**
- trauma and suffering as a result of events such as personal illness, death in the family, job loss, calamities such as floods or fires, civil unrest, etc.
  - Indigenous Peoples continue to suffer significant shocks and trauma at rates higher than non-indigenous people: abuse, suicide, domestic violence, incarceration etc.

**Cycles**
- patterns to the stages of people’s lives
- reproductive choices, family roles, relationships and seasonality
  - Colonial history and inter-generational trauma creates a cycle of social exclusion, crisis, violence, addictions, and depletion of resources
  - Mobility patterns — within and between cities, and to the land. Mobility complicates attachment and weakens participation in mainstream delivery models of education, employment and health
  - Life cycle patterns — e.g. early child bearing, going back to school after 25
Conclusion

In curating and editing the briefing papers, the team’s lead researcher Emmett Ferguson, has synthesized some broad themes coming out of the literature scan. Below he shares four key observations to be taken into account when working to promote the self-determination and sustainable livelihoods of urban Indigenous peoples in Manitoba.

1) Colonialism is everywhere.
Perhaps the most significant danger to the vitality of urban Indigenous peoples today is the assumption that colonialism has ended in Canada. While the review aims to give readers a better appreciation of the importance of Indigenous self-determination and de-colonization, this project itself is in some ways a product of colonialism: it seeks to provide insight into the fabric of Indigenous identities and communities for the ostensible purpose of informing policy directions by non-Indigenous government institutions. Urban Indigenous people remain a colonized minority who face extraordinary racism and exclusion in Canada, and who possess rights different to other urban Canadians. While the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples is in principle adopted in Canada, the brief investigation of population outcomes provided here shows that generations of colonial thinking and policy have significantly undermined efforts to assert self-determination. Colonialism is not just a policy issue: it is so rooted in Canadian social structures and culture that fundamental changes in our discourse, governance and legal structures will be required to remedy it.

2) A label is not the same as an identity.
An assumption behind this project is that a relatively stable social group exists in urban Manitoba who can be classified as ‘Indigenous’ for the purposes of policy and program interventions. Yet much of the literature reviewed seems to question this assumption. Labels such as Indian, Aboriginal, Indigenous, or First Nations, Inuit and Métis may actually contribute to other, not necessarily well-founded policy assumptions regarding the identities, objectives, aspirations and assets of individuals, or their communities. A ‘pan-indigenous’ approach may end up ‘smoothing over’ the great diversity of histories, understandings and ways of life within different Indigenous cultures, and among different people. There appears to be no ‘essential way’ of being Indigenous in the city or elsewhere, and so it would be misguided to develop policy action based on such a concept.

3) Urban Indigenous self-determination is poorly supported as a deliberate matter of policy.
Self-determination emerges from political rights. In Canadian cities, Indigenous peoples’ rights are fundamentally different from those of settlers, and indeed recent immigrants and refugees. Indigenous people enjoy more rights in some regions than others: their Treaty and Indian Status rights are recognized in different ways in different places.
From a national policy perspective, urban Indigenous people are not ‘doing Indigeneity’ in the way that is expected by settler governments. Living in a city was not anticipated in early treaties, and governments have struggled to develop a satisfactory understanding of, or method of governance for, diverse and mobile urban Indigenous peoples and their needs and interests. This contributes in both obvious and subtle ways to the alienation, exclusion and vulnerability of Indigenous peoples in urban settings.

The review further suggests that across Canada, each level of government may be waiting for another to act first. Some of this ‘silence’ on the issue of urban Indigeneity may be due to an anxiety about ‘owning the problem’ and thus being made directly (fiscally) responsible for a solution. In fact, no one government alone can reasonably provide the solution. It will require a ‘whole of government approach’ that honours and enables the right to Indigenous self-determination.

Indeed, this innovative initiative of Winnipeg’s *Intergovernmental Strategic Indigenous Alliance (ISIA)* is part of a deliberate effort to approach these issues simultaneously from the municipal, provincial and federal perspectives, incorporating the local knowledge and expertise of urban Indigenous peoples into planning and decision-making. Thus, it is hoped that this work continues and inspires further similar initiatives, and that urban Indigenous peoples soon find that their self-determination in urban spaces is more directly reflected in the fabric of governments, and their modes of service provision.

4) Increasing inequity is creating more injustice.
We are living in the most materially productive and yet highly unequal period in history. This inequity proceeds from, or seems to be substantially aided by, a discourse of ‘personal freedom’ and individual responsibility within a capitalist system and culture that uses material prosperity as an index for the moral value of the individual. Material inequity is thus exacerbated by the continued social and cultural stigma placed on all people experiencing material impoverishment. This review leads to the conclusion that material and cultural inequity move in lockstep to prevent the development of urban Indigenous Sustainable Livelihoods. We cannot continue to speak of the ‘social determinants of health’ without first ensuring access to the *material* determinants of health (e.g. housing, food and income). Until these inequities are eradicated, injustice will persist.
Bibliography


Bowdler, J., & Gorham, L. (n.d.). All In: Building the Path to Global Prosperity through Financial Capability and Inclusion. UNC Center for Community Capital, JPMorgan Chase & Co.


Brownell, M. D., Brownell, M., & Manitoba Centre for Health Policy. (2007). Next steps in the provincial evaluation of the BabyFirst program: measuring early impacts on outcomes associated with child maltreatment. Winnipeg, Man.: Manitoba Centre for Health Policy, Faculty of Medicine, University of Manitoba. Retrieved from http://www.deslibris.ca/ID/207838


Chateau, D., Doupe, M., Walld, R., Comm, B., Soodeen, R.-A., Ouelette, C., & Rajotte, L. (2012). Department of Community Health Sciences Faculty of Medicine, University of Manitoba.


Colleges Serving Aboriginal Learners and Communities 2010 Environmental Scan: Trends, Programs, Services, Partnerships, Challenges and Lessons Learned. (2010, November). Association of Canadian Community Colleges.


Marchetti, E. (2013). Victims or offenders: Who were the 11 Indigenous female prisoners who died in custody and were investigated by the Australian Royal Commission into Aboriginal Deaths in Custody? *International Review of Victimology, 19*(1), 37–49. https://doi.org/10.1177/0269758012447218


PAMELA ROSE TOULOUSE Ph.D. (2016). *WHAT MATTERS IN INDIGENOUS EDUCATION: Implementing a Vision Committed to Holism, Diversity and Engagement.* People for Education -


http://prospercanada.org/getattachment/bd2fbe0e-9647-4377-9df6-8cfe3c0cc9f9/The-Case-forFinancial-Literacy.aspx


